

**Ultra-Orthodox Jews in the Workforce: A Qualitative Study of Education**

by

Scott Klein

Dissertation Submitted to the Doctoral Program

of the American College of Education

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF EDUCATION

March 2021

Ultra-Orthodox Jews in the Workforce: A Qualitative Study of Education

by

Scott Klein

Approved by:

Dissertation Chair: Marsha Moore, Ph.D.

Committee Member: Joshua Reichard, Ph.D.

Copyright © 2021

Scott Klein

## Abstract

The purpose of the qualitative descriptive case study was to explore how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education among Haredi males in the United States. Unlike much of the U.S. population, Haredi males do not receive much secular education but receive religion-focused education, which does not adequately prepare them for the job market. Inadequate education can have a devastating effect on employability. Within the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community, the lack of core curriculum studies hindered the men's ability to gain employment and support their families. The goal for the study was to explore how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education and employment and to address the gap of knowledge surrounding the impacts of cultural and religious factors in academics. Using social cognitive theory, in-depth interviews were conducted in accordance with the qualitative descriptive inquiry research design with graduates of ultra-Orthodox education institutions, considering the various religious, ethnic, and cultural backgrounds of the subjects. A total of 10 participants were selected from a group of 30 males who were educated exclusively at yeshiva for the study, with semi-structured interviews and an online questionnaire being the two main sources of qualitative data collection from which the results and findings were drawn. The data were coded and analyzed using NVivo 12 under Braun and Clarke's six-step thematic analysis protocol. The findings indicated culture and religion affect the quality of education received, and skill sets lacked by the sample included language proficiency, lack of core education, cultural and religious restrictions, discrimination, and having large families. This study contributed to the body of knowledge in education by providing the context for the challenges faced by ultra-Orthodox Jews and the consequences associated with not attaining secular skill sets in favor of preserving cultural and religious heritage.

## Dedication

This dissertation is dedicated to my wife, Eli Klein, who provided patience, encouragement, and inspiration all throughout my academic journey. She was always by my side to let me know that through persistence, all my endeavors can be successful.

## Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge my chair, Dr. Marsha Moore, who provided instrumental feedback in allowing my study to take on its final form. She was always there to point me in the right direction whenever my research incurred roadblocks, and her guidance has been instrumental for my success at ACE.

I would also like to acknowledge my committee member, Dr. Joshua Reichard, and the ACE program director, Dr. Elizabeth Johnson, for their continuous commitment and dedication to the review and editing process. Without my committee members, my study would not have been possible. Lastly but not least, I would like to acknowledge the organizations, as well as the participants who provided critical data for this research.

## Table of Contents

List of Tables .....	x
Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
Background of the Problem .....	1
Statement of the Problem.....	3
Purpose of the Study .....	4
Significance of the Study .....	5
Research Questions .....	6
Theoretical Framework.....	7
Definitions of Terms .....	8
Assumptions.....	9
Scope and Delimitations .....	10
Limitations .....	11
Chapter Summary .....	13
Chapter 2: Literature Review.....	14
Literature Search Strategy.....	14
Theoretical Framework.....	15
Social Cognitive Theory and Religion.....	16
Social Cognitive Theory in Religious Education Institutions.....	17
Research Literature Review .....	18
Haredi Education .....	19
Ultra-Orthodox Judaism and Employment .....	33
Chapter Summary .....	47

Chapter 3: Methodology .....	48
Research Design and Rationale .....	49
Role of the Researcher .....	50
Research Procedures .....	51
Population and Sample Selection.....	51
Instrumentation .....	54
Data Collection .....	55
Data Analysis .....	56
Reliability and Validity.....	57
Credibility .....	58
Transferability.....	58
Dependability .....	58
Confirmability.....	59
Ethical Procedures .....	59
Chapter Summary .....	61
Chapter 4: Research Findings and Data Analysis Results .....	62
Data Collection .....	63
Instrumentation .....	65
Data Analysis and Results .....	65
Research Question 1 .....	67
Research Question 2 .....	69
Research Question 3 .....	70
Research Question 4 .....	73



Reliability and Validity.....	76
Credibility .....	76
Transferability.....	77
Dependability .....	77
Confirmability.....	77
Chapter Summary .....	78
Chapter 5: Discussion and Conclusion .....	79
Findings.....	79
Research Question 1 .....	80
Research Question 2 .....	81
Research Question 3 .....	83
Research Question 4 .....	85
Limitations .....	86
Recommendations.....	87
Implications for Leadership .....	88
Conclusion .....	89
References.....	90
Appendix A: Informed Consent.....	105
Appendix B: Recruitment Letter .....	112
Appendix C: Semistructured Interview Questions .....	113
Appendix D: Field Test of Instrument .....	114

## LIST OF TABLES

### Table

1. Participant Demographics.....	64
2. Major Themes in the Data.....	67
3. Strengths Haredi Men Bring to the Job Market.....	71
4. Strategies to Better Prepare Haredi Men to Enter the Job Market.....	74

## **Chapter 1: Introduction**

Many ultra-Orthodox Jewish males enter the labor market without adequate secondary and postsecondary education and struggle to find employment (Arlosoroff, 2016). Research indicates these individuals often lack the required skill sets, experience, and expertise needed to become productive employees in the corporate realm (Arlosoroff, 2016). For example, Haredi individuals, are ultra-Orthodox Jews who form a considerable subpopulation of the Jewish culture (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). While Haredi individuals may possess many unique technical attributes and skills (e.g., manual dexterity) and soft skills (e.g., emotional stability, agreeableness, conscientiousness), individuals often do not partake in traditional mainstream education (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). An inadequate education provided by the Haredi education system hinders these individuals in finding gainful employment and substantially increases the risk of poverty and dependence on government subsidies (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). A lack of proper formative education hinders Haredi individuals throughout life, limiting the ability to support themselves and contribute to greater society outside of the Haredi community (Arlosoroff, 2016).

Chapter 1 contains the background of the problem and the literature related to the topic. The problem statement, purpose, significance, and nature of the study are described. Also included are the research questions, definitions of terms, assumptions, scope and delimitations, and limitations. The chapter concludes with a summary as well as a transition to Chapter 2.

### **Background of the Problem**

The *Haredi* are ultra-Orthodox members of the Jewish society (Engelsman, Huss, & Cwikel, 2018). In 2014, the Haredi subpopulation comprised approximately 11% of the Israeli population (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017) and 6% of the U.S. Jewish population (Pew

Research Center, 2013). Since antiquity, education for Haredi boys and men consisted primarily of the study of the Torah, with a focus on encouraging boys to embody religious traditions and dedicate themselves to a lifelong pursuit as knowledgeable religious scholars (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019). In traditional Haredi society, girls receive more secular education than boys do, as girls are not expected to fill traditional religious roles in society (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019). Consequently, women have been generally able to support families even during youth, to allow more time for husbands to devote to Torah studies rather than be encumbered by work or secular education (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019). In Israel, where the largest group of Haredi individuals resides, only 50% of Haredi working aged men are employed, compared to 89% of the general working aged male population in Israel (Waksman, 2019).

In the United States, many Haredi choose to send children to yeshivas, private religious schools focusing primarily on studying Jewish texts rather than the traditional private schools or public schools providing more standard educational guidelines (Greenberg, 2018). In most U.S. states, laws mandate nonpublic schools must provide an education equivalent to education provided at public schools, and nonpublic schools are required to include instruction in English, math, U.S. history, and science (Greenberg, 2018). Reports from yeshiva graduates challenge the quality of the education received at yeshivas. In 2015, the New York City Board of Education launched investigations into educational neglect in yeshivas (Matthews & Frost, 2015). In 2018, the state of New York was sued for allegedly turning a blind eye to educational mismanagement in yeshivas and allowing yeshivas to continue teaching a curriculum lacking courses in the core competencies (English, math, U.S. history, and science; Greenberg, 2018).

The absence of these secular courses means many ultra-Orthodox Jews do not have the skills necessary to become productive employees (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). The

proportion of the Haredi community with college degrees (25%) is significantly lower than the total U.S. Jewish population (58%; Pew Research Center, 2013). Among the Hassidic Haredi in New York, 55% of workers earn less than \$50,000 a year, and 89% earn below \$100,000 (Pew Research Center, 2013). In contrast, 41% of the general Jewish population earn less than \$50,000 a year, and 63% earn less than \$100,000 (Pew Research Center, 2013). Increased competition for jobs coupled with the lack of competency in the core curriculum of secular studies make the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community, particularly males in the community, vulnerable to unemployment and lower annual incomes (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019; Waksman, 2019).

### **Statement of the Problem**

Little is known about how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education among Haredi males in the United States. The problem of how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education among ultra-Orthodox Jewish males the United States was explored via semi-structured interviews (Arlosoroff, 2016). Decreasing employment rates for ultra-Orthodox Jewish men (Waksman, 2019), coupled with reports of poor educational standards at yeshivas (Greenberg, 2018), indicated the education ultra-Orthodox Jewish boys receive may not adequately prepare them for employment in the modern job market. The extent of the problem was signified by evidence in the extant literature regarding the continued inadequate educational preparation of ultra-Orthodox Jewish males (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017), despite the increasing formation of international firms more inclined to hire these individuals (Albright, Winston, & Zappe, 2014). Individuals other than ultra-Orthodox Jewish males are likely to be affected by the issue, including ultra-Orthodox Jewish males' families. The greater U.S. society also is likely to be affected as the United States could forgo the economic earning potential

individuals may have and provide additional support to individuals and their families in the form of social welfare programs (Arlosoroff, 2016).

Using semi-structured interviews, the study was an examination of the experiences of 10 Haredi males in the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community in the United States as they searched for jobs. Numerous studies of the job market and its dynamics investigated what aids or hinders an individual from getting employment (Arlosoroff, 2016). Arlosoroff (2016), Genut and Ben-David Kolikant (2017), and Katzir and Perry-Hazan (2019) recommended further study to investigate how cultural and religious factors influence academics in ultra-Orthodox Jewish Haredi males whose values and beliefs play a significant role in the learning process. The literature presented a gap relating to how ultra-Orthodox Jewish male students describe the effect of cultural and religious factors in academics. The goal of the study was to address the gap in literature by exploring the barriers preventing ultra-Orthodox Jewish men from acquiring employment in the United States and to identify potential affordances helpful in assisting male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates to overcome these barriers.

### **Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of the qualitative descriptive case study was to explore how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education, using a sample of 10 Haredi males in the United States via semi-structured interviews. Research indicates increased competition for jobs coupled with a lack of competency in the core curriculum of secular studies make the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community, particularly males in the community, vulnerable to unemployment and lower annual incomes (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019; Waksman, 2019). Further research was needed to understand the effect of a Haredi education on unemployment among ultra-Orthodox Jewish males. The essence of using a qualitative descriptive case study research design was to

bring to the forefront some of the challenges faced by male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates who may not have employable skills comparable to traditional secondary school graduates.

### **Significance of the Study**

Approximately 43% of Haredi households in New York are below the poverty line, and another 16% are close to the poverty line (Rosenberg, 2018). Haredi communities have a greater percentage of families receiving cash assistance, food stamps, public health-care coverage, and Section 8 housing vouchers, as compared to the surrounding communities (Rosenberg, 2018). The percentage of people in Haredi communities utilizing public income support such as cash assistance, Supplemental Security Income, and Medicaid increased dramatically between 2007 and 2018 as the population grew rapidly without improvements in education (Rosenberg, 2018).

Research indicates non-ultra-Orthodox Jewish graduates who take part in the core curriculum activities arising from secular education are more prepared than yeshiva graduates to meet the challenges of the modern job market (Baum et al., 2014; Greenberg, 2018; Waksman, 2019). The researchers provided much-needed information on the barriers male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates perceived as hindering students from acquiring employment in the United States. Additionally, the information identified potential affordances helpful in assisting male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates to overcome these barriers. The goal of the study was to understand the perceived challenges male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates face as the individuals look for employment and to identify potential affordances helpful in assisting these individuals to overcome the described barriers. The study contributed to the knowledge base by exploring the real-life contextual effect the Haredi education system has on male ultra-Orthodox Jews as the individuals search for employment.

The study findings will be published and shared with the Jewish Haredi education officials and members of the Jewish community.

### **Research Questions**

The research questions for the study centered around the influence of religious and cultural beliefs on the attainment of employable skills, the specific barriers existing in acquiring employment, and how those barriers can be overcome. The difference between secular and religious-focused education was at the core of the reason why the questions were asked. The following research questions were considered for the purpose of this study.

Research Question 1: How have male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates' religious and cultural beliefs influenced the attainment of employable skills?

Research Question 2: What are the barriers male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates face in acquiring employment?

Research Question 3: What are the strengths male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates bring to the job market; what skills do ultra-Orthodox Jewish males lack?

Research Question 4: How can male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates be more prepared to enter the job market?

The a priori conjecture was the lack of education in fundamental secular subjects afforded to male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates creates a lack of employment skills among graduates. The lack of employment skills creates significant barriers for individuals who seek employment in the United States. The a priori conjecture was based on the assumption stating, while these individuals may possess strong soft skills (e.g.,



communication, work ethic), the lack of secular education creates key knowledge gaps for these individuals, potentially hindering the individuals when searching for gainful employment.

### **Theoretical Framework**

The theoretical framework used to guide the study was based on the tenets of social cognitive theory. Social cognitive theory dictates an individual's capacity to learn occurs within a social context (Bandura, 1989). According to the theory, learning is a process occurring through reciprocal and other forms of dynamic interaction with people, environments, and behaviors (Bandura, 1989). The social cognitive theory was also developed to describe the way people develop and practice behavior and the unique ways individuals maintain those behaviors, in addition to learning (Bandura, 1991). Bandura (2012) noted social cognitive theory distinguishes three components of an individual's agency: (a) personal, (b) proxy, and (c) collective. *Personal agency* is practiced individually, *proxy agency* occurs when an individual influences other people, and *collective agency* occurs when people work together to achieve a collectively desired outcome (Bandura, 2002).

The interpretation of the themes and patterns formulated regarding the research questions was facilitated by the application of the social cognitive theory. By pointing to the social context of culture, as the main reason why employment opportunities for Haredi males continue to remain poor, the researcher assessed existing strengths and skills lacking in Haredi males being able to present themselves with better situations in the U.S. job market. The qualitative data gathered provided detailed narratives of the participants regarding the barriers the participants see for Haredi male graduates in the job market, as well as the shortcomings of such participants socially and culturally, according to the perspectives of graduates who experienced the phenomenon firsthand.

### Definitions of Terms

The following terms are defined as they apply to the study. The terms are applicable for understanding the specific culture and educational setting upon which the study was based. The following key terms were considered for the study.

***Core Curriculum.*** The core curriculum is a set of courses considered academically and culturally essential for the general education of a student regardless of the field of study upon which future studies and life skills can be built and generally required before the student can move on to the next educational pursuit. The subjects generally include English (both grammar and composition), arts, mathematics, science, and social studies (Moran, 2019).

***Graduates.*** Graduates are people who have completed a course of study or training, especially people who have been awarded an undergraduate or first academic degree (Bittinger, 2017).

***Haredi/Ultra-Orthodox Jews.*** *Haredi/ultra-Orthodox Jew* is a term commonly reserved for those Orthodox Jews who claim not to make any compromises with contemporary secular culture by maintaining social solidarity and a cultural distance from the surrounding secular society, or essential changes in practicing Judaism from what tradition and halakhah sanctify. The Haredim also distinguish themselves by living in relatively insular communities, speaking Yiddish, sending children to yeshivas, arranging marriages, and being overwhelmingly endogamous (Engelsman, Huss, & Cwikel, 2018).

***Orthodoxy.*** Orthodoxy is a modern designation borrowed from Christian usage to describe the traditional section of Jewry, which maintains the halakhic way of life based on the Torah (Brown, 2018).

***Secular.*** *Secular* means *of the world* (the social, political, and cultural spheres as distinct from the religious sphere). In terms of Judaism, *secular* refers to Jews with no religious affiliation but who adhere to an ethnic, cultural, or national Jewish identity (Prawer Kadar, 2017). For the study, the term refers to the teaching and study of nonreligious subjects.

***Underemployment.*** Underemployment is the hiring of workers with postsecondary education into low-skill, low-wage jobs; underutilizing skills gained (Bell & Blanchflower, 2018).

***Yeshiva.*** The oldest institution for higher learning in Judaism, the yeshiva focuses on the study of traditional religious texts, primarily the Talmud, and, to a lesser extent, the Torah and is exclusively for Jewish males (Helmreich, 2000). The term can also refer to an ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school in the United States (Greenberg, 2018).

### **Assumptions**

Assumptions are defined as factors or conditions that are beyond the researcher's control and have the possibility of influencing the interpretation of study results (Percy et al., 2015). The assumptions guiding the study included the participants being truthful and honest about personal opinions and experiences, the attempt to minimize the distance with the participants, the appropriateness of the research questions, and the changes in the environment (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). The assumptions were important because participants were required to volunteer to take part in the study without economic motivations (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). While self-reporting is easily replicated, quantifiable, and allows for the collection of large amounts of data quickly and inexpensively, the procedure relies on the subjects being honest and not just acquiescing or wanting to seem good or successful (Percy et al., 2015). The difficulty was in

avoiding leading questions and eliminating social desirability bias to maintain reliability and validity. The research was based on inductive reasoning.

The participants were treated with as much sincerity and curiosity as possible, while actively seeking to minimize the distance between the parties. The participants' situations, backgrounds, and experiences were different, and the opinions provided may have been somewhat misconstrued despite the researcher's best efforts (Percy et al., 2015). Another assumption was the research questions were appropriate to the study, as the research questions were based in the literature and aligned with the study's purpose (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Due to the dynamic nature of the study linking people's actions to perceptions, the priori conjectures were slightly modified during the research process to fit new facts.

### **Scope and Delimitations**

The scope and delimitations are defined as the boundaries that a researcher sets to guide the study (Percy et al., 2015). The researcher investigated the barriers, affordances, and employability of ultra-Orthodox Jewish males educated exclusively in yeshivas in the United States. In-person open-ended interviews were conducted with 10 male participants throughout the United States, with particular attention given to the observation of the participants' thoughts and feelings in accordance with the recommendations from the literature (Spradley, 2016). The scope of the study was carefully chosen to ensure a highly descriptive narrative of the participants can be obtained for the formulation of appropriate themes and patterns emerging from the data.

No specific rules exist for determining the appropriate sample size for a qualitative study aside from the institutional guidelines suggesting at least 10 participants. For the purpose of the study, the sample size was limited to 10 ultra-Orthodox Jewish males in the United States

between the ages of 25 and 55 who were educated exclusively at a yeshiva, whether at home or in another educational institution, and who have been out of school for 5 years. The sample size was limited to 10 individuals due to the cost and time required in conducting in-person ethnographic interviews while allowing enough feedback to reflect most perceptions of the situation faced by the Haredim (Morse, 1994).

To maintain the focus of the study and limit indefinable variables, foreign-educated males and non-Jewish individuals were excluded as the education systems and communities of each student's upbringing differed greatly from those being researched and were not directly relevant to the study. Ultra-Orthodox women were deemed to be not appropriate to include in the study. The education of women within the Haredi community varies greatly, and social biases and norms affect the employment of women outside the home (Percy et al., 2015).

The researcher did not examine the conditions of economy or racism associated with employment opportunities, as the motivations of the employers would require a much deeper investigation and was unrelated to the focus of the study. Social class, marital status, and family size also were not considered for the study. The variables presented by these demographics are too problematic and would not have allowed for a focus on the quality of education and its effect on participants' job prospects.

### **Limitations**

Limitations refer to potential weaknesses in research that are beyond researcher control (Percy et al., 2015). In the study, the sample size was limited to 10 ultra-Orthodox Jewish males based on the recommendations by Morse (1994). The figure was a small percentage of the approximately 126,000 ultra-Orthodox Haredi-educated males who still identify as ultra-Orthodox (Greenberg, 2018). The quality of the data and the number of interviews determined

the amount of usable data. Qualitative interviews generate a large amount of data (Neumann, 2007). An inverse relationship exists between the amount of usable data and the number of participants needed (Neumann, 2007). The sample group was selected from carefully screened volunteers but may not have been truly random and may be limited in its generalizability of application to other geographic areas and scope not covered by the study.

While participants were assumed to be honest when providing answers to the interview questions, participants' willingness to share uncomfortable experiences or give accurate responses may be a limitation. Time constraints limited the study to 3 months. The restricted nature of the time frame may have affected the results by reflecting societal factors of the period, including the economy.

The interpretation of interviews is highly subjective as interviews may reflect the unconscious bias, experiences, and values of an individual who was educated in a yeshiva and experienced its weaknesses firsthand. Awareness of the condition specific to each participant and dedication to transparency were reflected in the collection and analysis of the data (Morse, 1994).

The study lacked generalizability, controls, and the ability to manipulate variables. The theory heavily focuses on processes of learning, and in doing so, disregards biological predispositions potentially influencing behaviors, regardless of past experience and expectations. The model did not focus on emotion or motivation, other than through reference to experience, as the constructs are not elements of the study's problem statement and purpose. The theory can be far-reaching and thus difficult to operationalize in its entirety.

## Chapter Summary

Decreasing employment rates for ultra-Orthodox Jewish men (Waksman, 2019), in conjunction with reports of poor educational standards at yeshivas (Greenberg, 2018), indicates the education ultra-Orthodox Jewish boys receive may not adequately prepare the students for employment in the job market. The purpose of the qualitative descriptive case study was to identify barriers hindering male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates in acquiring employment in the United States and to identify potential affordances helpful in assisting male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates to overcome these barriers.

The researcher utilized a qualitative descriptive case study. A qualitative research methodology allows for the study of complex phenomena involving participants' opinions and perceptions of external, real-world conditions and processes (Percy, Kostere, & Kostere, 2015). A qualitative descriptive case study was the most appropriate design for the present research, as the aim of the research was to identify barriers participants face, potential affordances helpful in assisting participants to overcome these barriers, and opportunities to improve preparedness of male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates to enter the job market.

Chapter 1 included an introduction to the study, including the background of the problem, problem statement, and purpose of the study. The research questions, theoretical framework, assumptions, scope, and limitations of the study were discussed. Chapter 2 presents a review of the literature covering all key themes of the study.

## Chapter 2: Literature Review

One byproduct of adhering too strictly to one's faith is one may not adequately develop the skill sets needed to navigate through various challenges in life. The purpose of the qualitative descriptive case study was to explore how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education, using a sample of 15 Haredi males in the United States via semi-structured interviews. The problem examined was the experiences of ultra-Orthodox Jewish males in the United States job market. The gap in knowledge for the study was in understanding the experiences of the unique religious group living in the United States. The following literature review includes information related to the literature search strategy, theoretical framework, and a comprehensive review of the literature related to all key themes surrounding the study.

### Literature Search Strategy

The literature review contains the following subsections: (a) Haredi education, (b) religious and cultural beliefs, (c) curriculum, issues, (d) comparison with secular education, (e) ultra-Orthodox Judaism and employment, (f) ultra-Orthodox Jewish men and employment, and (g) barriers to employment. The primary tools used for the literature search included electronic databases, such as EBSCOhost, ERIC.gov, Google Scholar, PloS One, and SpringerLink. Keywords and phrases used to identify literature included *social cognitive theory*, *social cognitive theory religious institutions*, *social cognitive theory religion*, *Haredi education*, *Haredi education men*, *issues with Haredi education*, *curriculum Haredi schools*, *Yeshiva education*, *Yeshiva schools male education*, *Yeshiva graduation*, *ultra-Orthodox education*, *ultra-Orthodox curriculum US*, *ultra-Orthodox employment US*, *ultra-Orthodox schools*, *ultra-Orthodox Jewish males employment patterns*, *ultra-Orthodox trends in employment*, *ultra-Orthodox males limitations in education*, and *comparison between secular and Jewish schools*.



### **Theoretical Framework**

The theoretical framework for the study was based on the tenets of social cognitive theory. Social cognitive theory dictates an individual's capacity to learn occurs within a social context (Bandura, 1989). Learning occurs through reciprocal and other forms of dynamic interaction with people, environments, and behaviors (Bandura, 1989). Not limited to the learning occurring to foster education, social cognitive theory was developed to describe the way people develop and practice behavior and the unique ways individuals maintain those behaviors (Bandura, 1991). Bandura (2012) argued social cognitive theory distinguishes three models of an individual's agency: (a) personal, (b) proxy, and (c) collective. Personal agency is practiced individually, proxy agency occurs when an individual influences others and collective agency occurs when people work together to achieve a collectively desired outcome (Bandura, 2002).

Forms of agency are often dictated by an individual's cultural upbringing (Bandura, 2002). Cultures are not static and are prone to evolving and backsliding, particularly as globalization contributes to the mass migration of people (Bandura, 2009). The majority of the research conducted using social cognitive theory posited the influence of one's various agencies and social interactions are usually physically close to the individual, such as the workplace or educational institution (Wood & Bandura, 1989). Social cognitive theory has also been used to describe gender differences (Bussey & Bandura, 1999) and how differentiation in forms of motivation can influence an individual's life path (Schunk & DiBenedetto, 2020). The use of social cognitive theory has been widely applauded throughout academic social psychological research (Nabi & Prestin, 2017).

Studies concerning social cognitive theory and the influence the theory has over motivation and behavior, particularly as the tenets relate to education and religion, and how these

in turn influence involvement in the workplace, have not been conducted on the scale of the present study. Following are details of the religion- and education-based studies using the theory as a guiding framework. In the context of education, most of the studies focused on college-age adult learners or perceptions of teachers (Schunk & DiBenedetto, 2016; Tang, 2016).

### **Social Cognitive Theory and Religion**

Religious societies developed through prosocial behaviors and the interpretation of what the societies deem to be good values or prosocial values (Rasit, Hamjah, & Mansor, 2016). The prosocial values were inherently aligned with social cognitive theory and dictate one's religious affiliations are the core creator of these values (Rasit et al., 2016). Some researchers have reasoned these same prosocial values are indoctrinated limitations falling under extreme forms of ideological conviction (Holbrook, Izuma, Deblieck, Fessler, & Iacoboni, 2016). Group prejudice and religious belief were susceptible to various forms of targeted neuromodulation, suggesting in-group settings such as religious institutions can narrow a child's development (Holbrook et al., 2016).

The literature on social cognitive theory and religion was limited in terms of specific investigation in the United States. Much of the literature about ultra-Orthodox Jews was situated in Israel, where the largest concentration of followers can be found. A study by Moskovich and Liberman (2018) examined the social identity of ultra-Orthodox students enrolled in schools in Israel. The authors examined a typically self-segregating demographic and the demographic's educational careers (Moskovich & Liberman, 2018). In the study, students integrated with secular peers. The researchers sought to identify feelings, personal identities, social proximity, and attributions perceived by ultra-Orthodox Jewish students to discern any difference between those students who self-segregated and those who did not. According to the findings, students in

self-segregated schools wanted to be in greater proximity to secular students, a finding contradicting the hypothesis of the study (Moskovich & Liberman, 2018).

Findings from the literature shed light on the value of using social cognitive theory to guide research on niche cultural and religious groups. The present study filled the gap in literature on social cognitive theory and ultra-Orthodox Jews in the United States (Friedman, Paradis, & Cukor, 2019). To fill the gap, the study extended the findings from previous studies and conducted further exploration of barriers experienced by Haredi males in the U.S. job market. The literature review continues with a discussion of social cognitive theory in religious education institutions.

### **Social Cognitive Theory in Religious Education Institutions**

Research into religious education using social cognitive theory has been broad and largely international but indicated significant results. Elliot (2019) sought to understand the context and nature of education in Catholic schools as the aspect of religious education was hypothesized as a unique challenge to teachers, compared to other aspects of a normal curriculum. According to Elliot, self-efficacy is a key component of social cognitive theory, which can be used to explore Haredi male perspectives of how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education. The way religion can limit the social development of some children was one of the largest issues hindering broader societal development in many emerging economies and has been discussed throughout academic literature (Spilka, 2019).

The arguments put forth by researchers revolved around the disparity concerning gender and the necessity of scientific exploration and subsequent ownership of minerals and other resources for financial growth of the inherently religious state, which are often hindered through aspects of religious education (Spilka, 2019). Culturally inclusive religions not allowing children

to acquire a general, secular education have been found to place additional stressors on students upon graduating (Spilka, 2019). The exact nature of these stressors has yet to be studied in an American context.

The major limitation found within religious education research, when guided by social cognitive theory, was the emphasis placed on learning about religious rituals (Kilpeläinen & Nielsen, 2018). Though these forms of religious education were successful in forming the intended educational perspectives and foundations in the minds of followers, religious education often limited the inclusion of followers into broader society (Kilpeläinen & Nielsen, 2018). Other researchers have posited these findings were simply limitations of research methodologies used to investigate such demographics (Weisberg, 2018). For example, under the American education system, parents had difficulty finding traditional Jewish education for children and often were faced with the decision of placing children in traditional, secular schools (Weisberg, 2018). The following review outlines the literature related to religious education and its impact on the employment of followers.

### **Research Literature Review**

The review of the literature focused on studies surrounding Haredi education and how the system is impacted by the religious and cultural beliefs of the Haredi Jew culture, as well as the secular culture (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019; Levin, 2018). Many empirical results are presented in terms of the curriculum and issues in current Haredi education, the link between education and employment, in addition to the challenges and barriers surrounding employment for the population. Throughout the review, the overall aim is to establish an objective assessment of the current state of Haredi education, aiding further research and allowing Haredi males to make further career advancements.

## **Haredi Education**

Since 2007, the number of pupils in the global education system has grown by 25% (Blass & Shavit, 2016). Within Haredi education, growth has been international (Blass & Shavit, 2016). Within international communities, Haredi education is separated by gender, with young men predominantly receiving teachings following the Torah and women being taught both Jewish education curriculum and secular studies (Levin, 2018).

Within Haredi, also known as ultra-Orthodox Jewish communities, followers have been known to dismiss any external influence by sources, including literature and the media (Bachner-Melman & Zohar, 2019; Levin, 2018). Such groups tend to maintain traditional customs, including dress codes and strict gender roles, which perpetuates through childhood education (Levin, 2018). Researchers have also noted followers within Haredi communities believe mainstream education is a threat to the more traditional values (Bachner-Melman & Zohar, 2019; Levin, 2018). As a result of these perceived threats, Haredi communities tend to provide little to no secular education to children (Blass & Shavit, 2016).

The threats posed are of serious concern to policymakers, educators, and researchers in the fields of sociology and social psychology, as the dangers pertain to an at-risk demographic for many issues related to poverty and a lack of social inclusion and development, which perpetuates mental and physical health decline (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019). The U.S. Supreme Court has not ratified policy recognizing children's right to a comprehensive education, or an education at all (Levin, 2018). Parents within Haredi communities have the right to refuse secular education to children, and privately funded schools are not forced to teach a traditional, secular education curriculum (E. Brown, 2018; Levin, 2018). The limitations in policy have led

researchers, such as E. Brown (2018) to argue Haredi children are insufficiently protected from a stagnant education.

A limitation discussed by Levin (2018) is the lack of comprehensive research conducted on Haredi communities in the United States. A plethora of data concerning Haredi education can be identified from Israeli investigations (Freund, Zriker, & Shor, 2019; Hamo & Idisis, 2017; Keren-Kratz, 2016). Though these studies are not necessarily relevant for shaping schooling and education policy in the United States, the importance may be in understanding how these communities integrate within international contexts to garner a full understanding of practices, and whether these behaviors can be identified in the context of the United States (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019). Katzir and Perry-Hazan (2019) found perceptions held by Haredi communities toward secular education and education reform are significantly detrimental to any kind of state intervention. The researchers argued governmental or district-wide school boards need to focus any effort to evolve the understanding of Haredi importance to secular educational curricula in the marketing and public discussion with cultural mediators (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019). The strength of Haredi education is seen through the curriculum, which shapes secular values in the minds of ultra-Orthodox Jews.

Alternatively, some studies have found Talmud-based education within Haredi communities can help students in specific study areas, such as computer science. Genut and Ben-David Kolikant (2017) found male Haredi students had the same grades as secular peers in computer science classes. The researchers made the argument the unique nature of Haredi knowledge fosters a form of conceptual knowledge for solving tasks and need not necessarily be viewed exclusively as a barrier to success (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). The specific

religious and cultural beliefs perpetuated by the Haredi education system is still significantly lacking in comprehensive research in the United States (Kingsbury, 2018).

**Religious and cultural beliefs.** Within the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community, values and strict behavioral codes are deeply set in religious tradition and the history of faith (Gabbay, McCarthy, & Fins, 2017). Since 1995, Haredi education perpetuating these values and codes has consistently undergone an expansion throughout Israel and the developed world, with funds being allocated to build strict education centers being dispersed regularly (Shiffer, 1999). Notwithstanding, the beliefs and values held by such communities have also been argued as significantly limiting to development within modern society (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018). Haredi communities have consistently been found to be poorer when compared to secular counterparts, suggesting financial literacy might be significantly less than appropriate for the group of individuals (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018).

May-Yazdi and BenDavid-Hader (2018) analyzed relationships between income, education, and financial literacy, while controlling for various background factors such as Internet connection and parental education perpetuating the cycle of deprivation experienced by these communities. The survey of 200 Haredi households was conducted using questionnaires, with responses analyzed using six multiple linear regression models and one logistic regression model. The core finding was Haredi Jews have significantly lower financial literacy when compared to secular counterparts, suggesting a deep relationship between income and lower financial literacy. Higher income was positively correlated with greater financial literacy, but those with higher income and financial literacy were also more likely to have attended an institution of higher education (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018). The finding reiterates the thoughts presented by other religious studies suggesting Haredi K–12 education may be

significantly limited, but if an individual can gain entry to a university or college, the individual's ability to move up the ladder and out of poverty is significantly higher (Kilpeläinen & Nielsen, 2018; Kingsbury, 2018; May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018).

Researchers stated the need for policies promoting Haredi schools in fostering a greater sense of importance in higher education attainment (Kilpeläinen & Nielsen, 2018; May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018). Given the rates of poverty within Haredi communities internationally, the religious and cultural beliefs of the Haredi, particularly as to matters related to education, may be the core problem with the ability to prosper to the same degree as other demographics (Barth & Benoliel, 2019). Barth and Benoliel (2019) argued the expansion of open systems within Western educational institutions needs to allow for greater growth of secular beliefs and values to integrate into Haredi curricula. The strict leadership styles employed at these schools can often limit such intended expansions (Barth & Benoliel, 2019). Such desired outcomes were posited in 2000, when the world made a promise to children from every nation regarding the right to an education, dictated as a fundamental human right (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018).

The Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) dictates, regardless of religion, ethnicity, or economic status, all individuals are entitled to a full and comprehensive education; such policies and conventions are not honored under the U.S. education system (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018; Kilpeläinen & Nielsen, 2018). In areas including the United States and many other cultural backdrops where human rights are ignored, the global promise of education was challenged within the balance between children's right to education and the rights of minorities to preserve culture via education (Fusch, Fusch, & Ness, 2018). The CRC did not



guarantee education as a fundamental human right, potentially one of the core issues facing the inclusion of Haredi people in mainstream culture and employment.

Researchers have demonstrated the trade-off between secular and right to religious education, as the most dominant in multicultural countries competing within the global economy, such as the United States, where beliefs and values can limit the inclusion of religious minorities into mainstream society (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018; Fusch et al., 2018). Some researchers have referred to the balance between competitiveness and multiculturalism as a necessary trade-off, which was explored using the right to education of Israeli ultra-Orthodox students by May-Yazdi and BenDavid-Hader (2018). Researchers mainly argue ultra-Orthodox students have the right to an education, putting forth the idea the state (and every state) is obligated to the provision and finance of educational institutions (Fusch et al., 2018; Kingsbury, 2018; Perry-Hazan, 2018). Despite the guarantee of knowledge provision, discrepancies exist in the quality of the education in ultra-Orthodox schools, with some more remote and inclusive institutions refusing to align with past research and even provide data on the success of students.

Blass and Shavit (2016) surmised, though multiculturalism might be achieved as these children are enrolled in ultra-Orthodox schools financed by the state, the competitiveness of these students in many business sectors is meager. The quality of the data provided under the archaic belief and value system is low (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018). May-Yazdi and BenDavid-Hader (2018) sought to identify the exact nature of multiculturalism as the practice stands for students in ultra-Orthodox Haredi schools, educated under the belief and value systems. The results revealed the extent of equality of educational opportunity (EEO) is significantly lower for students enrolled in ultra-Orthodox schools compared to secular counterparts (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018). The finding indicates Haredi schools are

underserving students and perpetuating placement in cycles of deprivation once students graduate (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018). Such findings confirm the argument Haredi students are significantly less competitive in the employment market as a result of limited cultural beliefs and values and the lack of new laws transitioning these trends to the modern, multicultural world (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019; May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018).

The extent of equality of educational opportunity is seriously declining along the schooling level, particularly for students in Grades 2–5 (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018). Considering the incremental trend of students enrolled in ultra-Orthodox schools (BenDavid & Iram, 2014), the low extent of EEO might hinder the acceleration of state competitiveness. The finding has implications for other countries with diverse populations striving to achieve both the sustainability of multiculturalism and the acceleration of state competitiveness. The issues are perpetuated by curriculum, discussed as follows.

**Curriculum.** Contrary to much of the literature, literature related to the Haredi curriculum states modern American ultra-Orthodoxy is facing a crisis caused by problems related to student identity formation (Krakowski, 2017). A study conducted in 2010 established the modern Orthodox student feels an increasing sense of disengagement from religious studies classes (Krakowski, 2017). The disconnect has been portrayed as a paradigm in the decline of the ultra-Orthodox lifestyle (Finkelman, 2011; Krakowski, 2017).

Researchers maintained such forms of student disengagement may have resulted from Haredi schools' inability to accommodate students' personal agency over epistemological commitments to religious pluralism and autonomy (Finkelman, 2011). Young Haredi students' ability to develop personal identities is arguably exacerbated by the dissonance between the religious teachings students are accustomed to at home and the predominantly secular view

imposed by American society (Perelman, Yaish, & Bental, 2019). Krakowski (2017) used data from fieldwork in an ultra-Orthodox school in the United States previously known to have implemented an exclusively problem-based learning (PBL) curriculum. The data were coupled with qualitative findings from interviews and discussions with teachers participating in PBL curricula and practices. From these data, the researcher suggested PBL may be uniquely suited to address the problem associated with lack of integration into Haredi traditions (Krakowski, 2017).

The major limitation of the research conducted by Krakowski (2017) may further perpetuate the social inequalities faced by young Haredi men and attempts to gain employment postgraduation. Krakowski's research centered on furthering the normalization of Haredi curricula in a way mitigating the sociocultural influences of American society, thereby causing a detriment to the students. The course of investigation may be why gaps in social inclusion and development are so highly observed in Haredi communities (Alpert, 2019).

According to Finkelman (2011), the development of Haredi/ultra-Orthodox Judaism and traditions occurred throughout the modern era as an attempt at isolationist reaction, propagated against the forms in which the freedoms of integration with globalization push young Jews away from strict observance of traditional Jewish law. As a result of the mild form of fundamentalism, Haredi Jewish males are taught to view the study of the Torah as especially central, often as the purpose of creation, thereby limiting the introduction to alternative and globalized concepts of creation (Ben-David Kolikant & Genut, 2017; Finkelman, 2011). Researchers found the Haredi education system discourages almost all forms of general education for young men, arguing education is designed to introduce individuals to a life of piety accompanying the study of the Talmud (Finkelman, 2011). By understanding the psychological nature of Haredi education, hypothetical lines between traditions related to poverty and actual levels of poverty experienced

by these demographics worldwide can be drawn. Though the thinking behind Haredi curriculum is aimed at teaching a form of independence, the curriculum mitigates many young men from being able to achieve financial independence for themselves in the same way young men can innovate for success in other cultures (Finkelman, 2011; Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017).

The nature of the time commitment imposed by the Haredi curriculum further mitigates any form of involvement in moneymaking activities (Iluz, Katz, & Stern, 2018). In Haredi tradition, young males are expected to follow deep involvement in full-time Torah study well into adulthood (Krakowski, 2017). The expectation differs for women. Under the Haredi education system, women are educated on the value of feminine domesticity and internal and external sexual modesty, while downplaying intellectual capital in abstract text knowledge (Iluz et al., 2018). Women are taught to resign themselves to a life as mothers, wives, and occasionally, in harsh juxtaposition to the ideal, are made to be breadwinners to support husbands' Torah study (Finkelman, 2011).

Contrary to previous findings, though the Haredi community and education system enjoyed a brief period of heightened growth from 2010 to 2020, the archaic education system has been and is undergoing a severe financial crisis and is hemorrhaging students at rates observed in secular education institutions (Finkelman, 2011). Specifically, some researchers propose Talmud Torah schools are facing these rates of financial insecurity and dropout as the schools have been inherently resistant to any process of standardization (Iluz et al., 2018). Forms of standardization relate to measurement, evaluation, and content within the curriculum (Iluz et al., 2018). In contrast, the globalized education system in the public sector has enormously increased standardization, allowing for the global movement of people across sectors and fields of study

and employment (Kohn, 2017). Talmud Torah Haredi schools can be private, designed for only ultra-Orthodox male students (Iluz et al., 2018).

Within the ultra-Orthodox schools, men are limited to studies of the Talmud, often ignoring forms of mathematics and literature critical to attaining employment postgraduation (Finkelman, 2011; Iluz et al., 2018). For what is largely thought to be ideological and religious reasoning, the curriculum in Haredi schools places an emphasis on total independence of individuals at all grades and education levels, and the resistance of assessment, such as testing (Iluz et al., 2018). As a result of these curriculum-based ideologies, such institutions have rarely been investigated by international researchers (Iluz et al., 2018).

An example of a study not seeking to understand the nature of Haredi schools was conducted by Kohn (2017). Kohn's research began in 2012 when a team of curriculum specialists in Israel was asked to develop a new Jewish studies curriculum for an Australian Haredi school. Within the research and development of the curriculum, the school administrators and Israeli specialists centered the focus on the student voice, as the focus had been shown as a critical element in curriculum-based deliberations and decision making (Kohn, 2017). Kohn argued previous research had shown teachers' assumptions about what students would find interesting and want to learn about had repeatedly been proven inaccurate. According to the findings, the curricula in Haredi schools have veered far from what students would consider interesting or relevant to the needs of the modern world, but the finding was limited to an Australian demographic (Kohn, 2017). From an international perspective, the findings from the research suggest the lack of student voice in curricula for Haredi schools is a significant limitation for the development of a Haredi education system around the globe, as well as for the

students learning within the system. The lack of student voice in curricula has been argued as a major issue facing the international Haredi community (Kohn, 2017).

**Issues.** Within Haredi education systems, schools largely set curricula without any major form of standardization, leading to disparities in educational attainment in many topics (Gal, Morgenstern, & Elimelech, 2018). Autonomy leads to discrepancies in reportage and the actual education level of graduates from Haredi schools (Gal et al., 2018). Much of the research into the issues presented by the Haredi education system focuses on aspects considered *deviant* within these populations, such as low academic achievement (Gal et al., 2018), teen pregnancy (Blumen & Freedland, 2019), and spiritual risk (Nadan et al., 2019).

In the example of teen pregnancy, studies have focused on means of mitigation, as modesty and gendered hierarchies are vehemently instilled and communicated in Haredi schools (Heinemann, Atallah, & Rosenbaum, 2016). In the context of secular schools, student attendance has become one of childhood's defining experiences as the practice exposes children to broad academic knowledge and the development of intellectual capital and skills, but also the alternative curriculum of socialization by the young (Blumen & Freedland, 2019; Gal et al., 2018). The same socializations do not occur in the Haredi education system, leading to a lack of appropriate sexual education for both male and female students (Schapiro-Halberstam & Josephs, 2018).

Issues surrounding socialization are further compounded by the rates of young students perceived to be moving away from traditional ultra-Orthodox values and studies (Nadan et al., 2019). Though previously discussed studies posited Haredi communities shun outside influence (Levin, 2018), arguments put forth by researchers, such as Nadan et al. (2019,) and the emphasis placed on Torah-oriented study in other research suggest the real issue facing Haredi

communities is the younger generations no longer want to follow ancestors' traditions of exclusion. Students in urban Haredi communities are consistently found to be more inclusive of "other" students, such as those with disabilities, than those in rural nonintegrated Haredi communities (Glaubman & Lifshitz, 2001). Further investigation is necessary to fill gaps in research related to the reality of the problem of ideological discrepancy between generations.

Ariel (2016) found when Haredi Jews discuss ideology, the individuals are often found to talk with an enormous amount of self-confidence and an inherent degree of single-mindedness, per the requirements of the educational curriculum in Haredi schools. When studies, such as Finkelman's (2014), progressed further in the investigation of fundamental Haredi education, the studies revealed an almost exclusive degree of ambivalence toward such things as Zionism, the State of Israel, secular Jews, isolationism, Torah-only education, Israel's multiculturalism, poverty and the Kollel life, and gender roles and rabbinic authority. Finkelman argued the forms of Haredi ambivalence identified in Israel stem from complexities related to trying to implement incessant and dogmatic isolationism in the social context of a developed and modern, open Jewish society. The findings are either indicative of the standard of education, the limitations of actual ideological development in Haredi schools, or the gradual growth of inclusion sought by younger generations of Haredi Jewish males. The study was aimed at discerning between these three options.

Researchers have consistently found the mismanagement of money within ultra-Orthodox education (Cohen, 2017). In international studies, the funding of ultra-Orthodox education is a major political discussion (Lipshits, 2015), but given the insular nature of Haredi education, an investigation and a problem-solving approach are often impossible. Some researchers have been able to use data to compare Haredi education with secular education.

**Comparison with secular education.** A major limitation of the research concerning both Haredi and secular education systems is most studies are centered on international case study examples. The findings from studies may inform the findings of the present study. A study by Cochran (2017) revealed, in Israel, the two fastest growing religious groups continue to be ultra-Orthodox and Muslim Israeli Arabs. The two religious groups are not learning to integrate lifestyles and traditions into modern democratic principles or marketable skills (Cochran, 2017). Limitations on educational development hinder the individuals in being able to assist in the economic development of Israel, which is of significant concern to both policymakers and sociologists alike (Cochran, 2017).

Issues may not be unique to fundamentalist education institutions, such as Haredi and Israeli Arab schools, as other studies identified Israelis attending secular and other forms of Israeli government schools are technically academically behind in mathematics as measured in 2011 international achievement tests (Cochran, 2017). Cochran (2017) demonstrated the history of religious integration into traditional education from 1928 to 1955 built the foundational aspects for the current divisions in educational attainment by Jews across Israel.

Many of the studies investigating differences in Haredi and other education curricula place particular emphasis on the importance of public and state-led policy to foster greater adherence to standards and diversity in educational content (Kaufman, 2019). Kaufman (2019) argued state regulation of independent faith-based schools is a complex process in the United States as the regulation involves balancing multiple variations and specific case law on human rights. When applied to the specific demographics of parents and children who uniquely identify both as citizens of a liberal democratic state and as followers of an insular and limited religious



tradition, researchers and policymakers are faced with issues related to ethical pluralism (Kaufman, 2019).

The way ethical pluralism influences comparisons between secular and traditional religious values are not particularly understood in academic literature focused on the United States (Kaufman, 2019). From studies concerning ethical pluralism, results have suggested those institutions limiting the educational variation of students do not actually fall under any form of ethical consideration (Kaufman, 2019). Brown (2018) surmised the limitations are best exemplified by the consistent research finding those students who leave Haredi tradition are often ignored for the detriment education placed on the ability to integrate into secular society.

Studies comparing students pre- and post-Orthodoxy have shown the limitations and negative impact of schooling may even be a significant contributing factor to the decision to leave traditional practice and community (Brown, 2019). Such studies have found ex-Orthodox Jews state the various aspects of personal education experiences, such as differing expectations for male and female students, the focus on modesty yet financial leadership for females, and exclusively Torah-led scholarship for males, are an inherently constricting and oppressive issue not experienced when these students enter secular education institutions (I. Brown, 2019). I. Brown's (2019) study highlighted the significant inequities faced by Haredi Jews in school compared to secular counterparts.

Even ultra-Orthodox Jews living in urban communities in the United States have been found to compartmentalize secular integration from a cognitive perspective, meaning even those who take part in research concerning ultra-Orthodox Jewish education as compared to secular education often release limited or misleading data to researchers (Bieler, 1986). Some researchers comparing Haredi education and secular schools also posited secular institutions are

wrong in the stance fostering diversity in thought (Haller, Golden, & Tavecchio, 2018). Studies comparing secular and Haredi education have also realized limited results as so few Haredi men are willing to discuss personal careers in education (Perelman et al., 2019).

Ultra-Orthodox followers are inherently limited in study in the United States, and the nature of the ultra-Orthodox education perpetuates the group's segregation from traditional society. The segregation led to a plethora of problems related to issues of social work, policy, and long-term economic development as a niche demographic living in the United States (Freund, 2019). Contrary to the leadership and administration of ultra-Orthodox education institutions, the evidence from the discussion suggested young Haredi Jews are not aligned with segregation from modern society. The major issues pertaining to Haredi education appear to be (a) mismanagement of funds and allocation of costs in running ultra-Orthodox institutions; (b) a lack of consistency in the curriculum wanted by the students and what is presented for learning; and (c) a lack of inclusion with modern secular education, which limits the ability to assimilate into the cultures surrounding personal lived experiences outside of school.

The significant limitations identified throughout the literature related to Haredi education was the methodologies employed (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019). Within the scope of literature identified, few centered on an American population of ultra-Orthodox Jewish education institutions, or demographics in general. The emphasis on studying Haredi Jews in Israel places limitations on the scope of understanding. The gap in literature pertaining to Haredi Jews in the United States was the largest limitation identified in reviewing relevant literature (Arlosoroff, 2016, Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). The following subsection continues with a discussion of ultra-Orthodox Judaism and employment research.

## **Ultra-Orthodox Judaism and Employment**

Given the inherently inclusive nature, Haredi Jews are particularly wary of revealing personal information regarding income and financial situation (Waxman, 2017). What can be discerned from the Haredi existence in the United States is the Haredi often go through traditional schooling and eventually go on to lead lives similar to other types of Jews, often marrying at the same rate, having similar numbers of children. Employment remains a key area of investigation lacking ample data (Waxman, 2017). Researchers such as Waxman (2017) argue, from what evidence can be uncovered, and despite the number of more modern Orthodox Jews earning an annual income of \$150,000 and over, one inherent limitation placed on Jewish males is much of the life comes with an incredibly high cost. The lack of inclusion in traditional society has dominated the course of investigation into Haredi male employment.

Prior research into Haredi Jews argued lack of inclusion has been historically perpetuated by the fact many Haredi Jews traditionally spoke Yiddish, but the number of Yiddish speakers has drastically declined since 1998 (Beer, 2018; Hary & Benor, 2018). The majority of Haredi Yiddish Jews in the United States are descended from Eastern European Jews who fled Germany and other parts of Europe during and after World War II (Beer, 2018; Hary & Benor, 2018). Some researchers have hypothesized the reluctance to integrate into modern society stems from the near destruction during the Holocaust, and fears if male and female Haredi Jews become too dependent on secular lifestyles and employment, threats of similar nature will confront the group in the future (Hary & Benor, 2018).

One of the largest sectors of employment within the U.S. Haredi community is the printing of Haredi literature, which is almost exclusively conducted on American soil (Hary & Benor, 2018). The scope includes works such as children's books, newspapers, magazines,

various Yiddish and Haredi periodicals, and online media, such as blogs and other websites (Beer, 2018; Hary & Benor, 2018). The use of the Yiddish language unites many Haredi peoples with a sense of community (Russo-Netzer & Bergman, 2019). Within these communities, microeconomics takes place fostering a further dependence on one another (Russo-Netzer & Bergman, 2019). Some research has suggested the use of Yiddish gives Haredi Jewish communities in the United States an edge over other monolingual religious and secular groups (Chiswick & Miller, 2018).

Chiswick and Miller (2018) used a group of pooled data taken from 2005 to 2009 via the American Community Survey to analyze any perceived economic benefits of being associated with being capable of bilingualism. The data were taken exclusively from U.S.-born adult men from a range of demographic backgrounds, including those who spoke Yiddish and other dialects associated with ultra-Orthodox Judaism (Chiswick & Miller, 2018). Within the context of other studies, the ability of bilingualism by those individuals born to immigrant parents or grandparents, but in the United States, is defined as speaking a different or additional language at home to English (Chiswick & Miller, 2018).

Native-born bilingualism is rare in almost all parts of the world where a single language makes up the national norm (Chiswick & Miller, 2018). In the United States, only 6.5% of the population reported speaking a second, non-English language either at home or work (Chiswick & Miller, 2018). Of the initial 6.5%, more than 70% reported speaking Spanish as a second language, suggesting the Yiddish communities of the United States either did not take part in the study in a large or formal way or are a small percentage of the U.S. population, the latter being the most likely scenario (Chiswick & Miller, 2018). In addition, most of the native-born bilingual individuals who took part in the study reported speaking English well (85%), with most

of the others speaking the language well (10%) (Chiswick & Miller, 2018). The findings suggested Yiddish communities, despite the use of Yiddish and the nomenclature of the Talmud, Haredi in the United States are integrated enough to use English and thus are theoretically able to take part in menial jobs better supporting financial expansion.

Other variables identified in the same study included, overall, people who were bilingual earned 4.7% less than monolingual English speakers (Chiswick & Miller, 2018). The finding may account for the consistent finding Haredi Jews earn less than other Americans, despite one study identifying similar levels of income. Also, the researchers discovered within the data an earnings differential that varied sharply by the language spoken (Chiswick & Miller, 2018). Those who speak variations of Native American languages, Pennsylvania Dutch, and Yiddish have low earnings, but the lower levels were due to a tendency to insulate themselves from larger American society and live in geographically spatial or communally cultural enclaves (Chiswick & Miller, 2018). According to Chiswick and Miller (2018), individuals who speak both English and Hebrew earn significantly more than individuals who speak only Hebrew. The study is inherently important to the course of research as the study sheds light on why Haredi Jews struggle with economics and employment in the United States. Despite being bilingual, the choice to self-segregate and limit integration with other American demographics in general (Waxman, 2017) has hindered the ability to realize financial independence in America, similar to the situation observed in Israel.

In the late 1990s, the largest concentration of Haredi and Yiddish-speaking Jews west of Chicago was situated in the Boyle Heights neighborhood of Los Angeles, California (Luce, 2018). Within the neighborhood, the Jewish groups shared apartment buildings with immigrants from all over the world, including Japan, China, and Europe (Luce, 2018). As children grew and

aged out of family homes, the growing sociodemographic evolutions occurring in Los Angeles either pushed out young people or provided greater opportunity elsewhere, particularly during the mid-2000s (Luce, 2018). The breakdown of community closeness may be a reason so few Haredi Jews were able to move out of the cycle of poverty, a common theme within the families before the 1990s (Luce, 2018). Despite abject poverty, Haredi Jews consistently voted in favor of fiscally conservative governance (Hakak, 2016). The voting tendencies further limited the Haredi ability to expand into new markets, and Republican leadership and governance also limits the expansion of various economic activities for already-poverty-ridden citizens (Hakak, 2016). Unlike most of the American Jewish counterparts, Orthodox Jews were significantly more likely to identify as Republicans and take conservative positions on social issues such as homosexuality, financial literacy, and gender roles, suggesting education has not only limited the ability to earn money but also shaped intellectual capital in a way in which individuals actively vote against secular economic interests (Hakak, 2016).

On average, Haredi Jews in American were far more religiously committed when compared to other Jews and were found to be much younger than other U.S. Jews, and as a result, the Haredi are having bigger and bigger families, further compounding the issues related to financial inequality and the need to provide for many people at home (Hakak, 2016). Ultra-Orthodox Haredi Jews tended to receive significantly less formal, secular education, even in a passive way, than did other American-born Jews. As a result, only a third of Orthodox Jewish adults had a high school education or less, compared with just 15% of other Jews, who are far more likely to attend college and enroll in institutes of higher education (Hakak, 2016).

A majority of studies centered on the Haredi employment trends since 2010 have come out of an Israel social context, despite tendencies to go quite deeply into the topic. For example,

a study by Regev (2017) examined patterns of Haredi integration into the labor market to conduct an inter- and multisector analysis comparison. Regev examined Haredi employment optionality in Israel, and how these options have a direct impact on earning abilities but have been found to differ based on various interpersonal and education factors, such as individual education level, field of research and study, form of employment branch, and individual place of residence. Since 2016, Israeli citizens in general and across all Jewish demographics have witnessed a consistent rise in all employment rates (Waxman, 2017), but especially among Haredim, who are typically the least likely demographic of Jew to be employed (Regev, 2017).

Due to significant limitations in methodologies within various surveys and samples, as well as the reliance on several different identification methods, the exact frequency of Haredi employment in Israel is still open to debate (Regev, 2017). In an attempt to mediate these limitations presented by methodology, Regev used official Israel Tax Authority data to discern how trends in Haredi employment have changed, and with a greater degree of methodological accuracy, as the data are not based on a sample but rather on the entire population. The data sets continued to be limited by the fact data were only available from 2008 to halfway through 2013 (Regev, 2017).

Regev (2017) identified, as of 2008, approximately 64% of Haredi women from younger demographics, as well as approximately 27% of Haredi men age 23–30 had at least 1 month of formal employment per year within the subsequent 5 years. These figures rose by 9 percentage points for both women and men, but more women were likely to take on additional work due to educational limitations (Regev, 2017). Comparatively, the growth in the ability of young men to gain employment was significantly lower, as many were resigned to continue Talmud studies (Regev, 2017). Despite these lower rates when compared to female counterparts, Haredi men

have experienced a large upswing in employment opportunity and in gaining formal employment, which Regev (2017) identified has occurred concomitantly with rising male Haredi academic study rates.

The results pushed Regev (2017) to testify to the new economic reality stating young Haredi men need to gain a greater educational background and expand academic standing in order to meet the needs of the modern world as related to employability and the ability of a man to provide for his family. Overall, the work conducted by Regev (2017) identified each Haredi student's employment rate is similar to the same rates associated with academic degree graduation. Regev (2017) furthered certain study majors, such as management, can enable male Haredi graduates to find work in Israel with relative ease, while others, such as law, pose employment challenges for Haredi due to the insular nature of Haredi communities and how Haredis choose to speak to non-Haredi individuals (Regev, 2017). The findings suggest Haredi students need to improve education attainment to be considered for better paying work within the wider economy. Regev also suggested the relationship between education and work is evolving for younger Haredi Jews, and indoctrinated social norms are not sticking through adulthood.

Kay and Levine (2019) examined the differences in various employment-related values, individual expectations, and personal agency behaviors between millennial Haredi Jews who were found to be significant users of technology and social media and those who self-reported difficulty in discerning whether these values are shaped by access to the Internet. The researchers delineated the growth and development of Haredi millennial behavior in a spatial context of Israel. The researchers noted, as a result of strict religious and community norms, many Haredi millennials have been shielded from emerging forms of digital technology, particularly the Internet and the various functionality associated with the World Wide Web, such as text



messaging and social media (Kay & Levine, 2019). Participants in the study who were raised and remained within Haredi communities and did not encounter the Internet with any regularity as children were still unfamiliar with social media and other aspects of the World Wide Web long into adulthood and had little interest in the use thereof. The finding was compared with the participants who had far greater levels of social media use and revealed Haredi millennials who enter adulthood and have had long-term use of social media are far more likely to fit into modern and evolved forms of employment than disconnected cohorts (Kay & Levine, 2019).

Most of the studies centered in the Israeli context of Haredi employment were almost exclusively united on the finding Haredi men are more likely to acquire better paying work in adulthood after having graduated from a higher education institution (Levy, 2019). Such studies consistently attempted to inspire integration into the normal working world of Israel by non-Haredi Jews toward Haredi Jews (Levy, 2019). Programs have been developed throughout academic literature attempting to develop employment opportunities for Haredi Jews living in Israel. Levy (2019) developed an innovative undergraduate program aiming to be sensitive to the increasing demand for higher education by the multicultural population in northeastern Israel, a spatial area predominantly made up of Haredi communities. The program was designed with the purpose of interweaving different types of technological, informational, and societal facets of the international world of business, globalized organizations, as well as smaller communities to prepare students for successful information systems careers in the technological sector (Levy, 2019). Levy's focus was on a group of ultra-Orthodox students who graduated in 2017 and represented one of the few adequate studies conducted on the ultra-Orthodox Jew population. Levy further claimed, as a result of recent calls for changing the low employment rate of Israeli

ultra-Orthodox Jews, and for enabling employment in fields offering higher paying jobs, such programs designed to fill gaps in education may prove fruitful.

A search of the literature revealed limited information relating to Haredi employment status in the United States. The data sets either used archaic data or were inherently limited in terms of findings and application of the findings to the current state of affairs. One reason for these consistent limitations is the emphasis placed on studying young Haredi women and employment opportunities, as women are often forced to be the breadwinners for families while husbands continue to attend Talmud studies. Data from studies concerning Haredi women's opinions on life and degree of satisfaction are gradually showing an increase in the emphasis placed on job satisfaction and professional life (Freund et al., 2019). Similarly, Freund et al. (2019) found Haredi women's desire for self-fulfillment, for professionalism, and to be able to work has become a core source of self-expression and fulfillment. Freund et al. (2019) asked more than 200 Haredi women in Israel to answer a questionnaire related to occupational, familial, and personal ideological-spiritual fulfillment items. The findings indicated the existence of new, positive correlations among self-expression, job satisfaction, and aspects of family life, but predominantly the occupational experience (Freund et al., 2019). Maintaining such trends is possible for Haredi women, given the emphasis placed on Haredi men's education within the traditions of religion.

Researchers have maintained, within ultra-Orthodox Israeli Haredi societies, the cultivation of male leadership provides control over sources of knowledge and education, so women are largely directed toward fields of knowledge regarding education and social welfare, remaining in a home environment throughout one's professional life, which is only required if the husband cannot financially support the family (Feldman, 2019). The control of male

leadership is present in the lives of female workers even when working outside the home (Feldman, 2019). Male leadership is often established through the day-to-day conversations and guidance of ultra-Orthodox society in Israel, wherein the exclusively male political and spiritual leaders encourage women to garner agency in academic and professional education to be able to fulfill themselves independently and to make a respectable living for the family (Feldman, 2019).

Typically, men are the ones dictating to Haredi women about the importance of integration within the modern workplace, ownership, and hierarchy as a form of control (Feldman, 2019). These social changes may eventually lead to the development of actual female autonomy within the Haredi female communities of Israel and the United States. These dictatorships often relate to higher educational attainment and are reshaping occupational and academic trends and normality throughout ultra-Orthodox employment (Braun-Lewensohn & Kalagy, 2019). The trends in Haredi employment suggest changes are occurring as more individuals become aware earning a higher education qualification has a direct positive impact on an individual's ability to earn more money, a core value within Haredi communities (Braun-Lewensohn & Kalagy, 2019).

A major limitation in the extant literature is the high concentration of studies taking place in Israel. As so many young Jews continued to feel a sense of responsibility and kinship with the Israel homeland, many young Haredi males in the United States were perhaps also attempting to move educational attainment higher. Whether or not older Haredi males were open to these social changes and allowed the changes to happen is unknown, but many researchers suggest elder generations of male Haredi will attempt to limit these expansions and return to a normalized trend in scholarship for Haredi males (Braun-Lewensohn & Kalagy, 2019).

**Ultra-Orthodox Jewish men and employment.** Most of the studies concerning ultra-Orthodox Jewish men were inherently limited in terms of geographic scope as the works were centered on an Israeli context. As of 2016, Haredi males made up only 11% of the total population in Israel, but the population is expected to increase roughly 18% by 2034 (Malach, Cohen, & Zicherman, 2016). As a result of low economic standing, Israel has attempted to cultivate policy to integrate Haredi males into higher paying jobs, not just more jobs (Malach et al., 2016). Such policies have introduced Haredi men to career counseling and employment centers, and programs continue to be developed specifically focusing on the male Haredi Jew (Malach et al., 2016).

The Israeli government has identified trends among Haredi Jewish males suggesting the group earns less than 72% of the average wages in Israel, and poverty levels of Haredi male Jews living in other nations are likely the same; reportage of these rates has vastly misled policymakers (Haron & Azuri, 2016). One plausible explanation is the greatest limitation facing Haredi males: the inability to develop a foundational understanding in broad subject matter (Haron & Azuri, 2016), so many places of employment are forced to bring Haredi men up to speed on basic aspects of the work (Malach et al., 2016).

Héliot, Gleibs, Coyle, Rousseau, and Rojon (2019) argued, despite the consistent finding stating Haredi males need a high level of support in entering the modern workplace, studies have suggested women are offered as much opportunity as possible to foster earning potential because Haredi males are demanded to continue with scholarship and education well into adulthood, without being distracted by employment. Notwithstanding, Haredi males want to be part of the modern workforce (Héliot et al., 2019). As a minority group in Israel and the United States,

Haredi men also need to overcome cultural barriers limiting communication and integration with other cultures within the workplace (Hakak, 2016).

Studies argue Haredi men's cultural approach to life falls too far from those observed in secular and other communities, and employers are reluctant to hire the men as a result of potential litigation and internal marketing issues associated with extreme diversity (Vivod, 2019). Research coming out of Israel claims integration of ultra-Orthodox Jewish males into the highest rungs of the employment market is of utmost importance to the nation, and further research is recommended to identify how best to achieve the improvement on an international level (Malach et al., 2016). Some researchers stated the best means of achieving the improvement will be through integrating education for employment into Haredi men's work in the army (Vivod, 2019). In a heightened intellectual and physical environment, Haredi men are forced to integrate with non-Haredi men and develop a sense of teamwork and camaraderie (Vivod, 2019).

Coping with secular norms is one of the core requirements facing the Haredi male community and dictates job satisfaction and ability to maintain employment in secular environments (Braun-Lewensohn & Kalagy, 2019). In an Israeli study exploring the ways in which ultra-Orthodox individuals cope when facing secular norms and values in the workplace and broader environment, data from more than 600 Haredi men regarding various elements of personal identities and different working environments were used to study how these facets influenced character and behavior (Braun-Lewensohn & Kalagy, 2019). Individuals in the dominant sectors of ultra-Orthodox society and in leadership positions reported a higher sense of integration with the ultra-Orthodox Jew community and stronger religiosity. In contrast, individuals from the minor sectors of employment reported greater openness to the job's social

environment and new demographics of friendship outside of Haredi (Braun-Lewensohn & Kalagy, 2019).

Younger Haredi males also reported a greater ability and yearning to integrate with communities outside of Haredi education and the ability to work will be hindered (Seginer & Mahajna, 2018). The only studies finding Haredi males to be significantly different in the world of work related to how the men approach social work, with secular males preferring group and inclusive therapies, whereas Haredi males felt it more appropriate for individuals to work through personal issues independently (Freund, 2019). Social aspects have consistently broken down barriers between Haredi males and other demographics of people around the world (Lavee, Kahn, & Fisher, 2018). Haredi men arguably face the biggest barrier to employment from a personal perspective: themselves (Lavee et al., 2018).

**Barriers to employment.** Researchers, such as Malach et al. (2016), have stated the barriers to employment among Haredi males are (a) lack of knowledge, (b) culture, (c) limited demand for Haredi workers, and (d) limited access to positions due to a lack of information regarding job opportunities. Many Israeli and Haredi researchers have focused efforts to reshape the mindset of secular communities to the benefits of the Haredi male attitude toward employment. Studies indicated that within secular education, Haredi men perform better in group tasks wherein effective teamwork is required, particularly as to individual strengths and patterns of success (Ben-David Kolikant & Genut, 2017). Patterns are considered to be statistically significant and suggest Haredi men's alternative education has fostered a great sense of personal confidence and agency in young men, a trait typically not identified in any other demographic (Ben-David Kolikant & Genut, 2017). The trait was found to be most apparent when discussing the nature of performance and what constitutes a positive performance by Haredi males; as a

demographic, these young men are inherently confident compared to secular counterparts, even in open group discussions in secular education institutions and workplaces (Ben-David Kolikant & Genut, 2017).

The sense of confidence can also be a significant limitation for Haredi men in the United States as the overconfidence can be deemed inappropriate to modern employers, especially those who are not Haredi (Metters, 2019). Accordingly, one of the biggest barriers to young Haredi males gaining adequate employment may be attitude toward non-Haredi people, which can often be abrasive and unfriendly, even if what the individuals are communicating is true (May-Yazdi & BenDavid-Hader, 2018). For as much as financial literacy and actual academic knowledge and attainment remain low within these populations, both in the United States and Israel, the attitude of Haredi Jews toward anyone considered not from the selected culture can be off-putting and is likely why these populations have been largely left to themselves in the U.S. system (Mendes, 2018). Unlike non-ultra-Orthodox Jewish groups, such as left-wing and liberal Jews, Haredi men are far more likely to dismiss work opportunities based on the limiting feeling of job satisfaction among Haredim for the work output (Mendes, 2018). The attitudes have been observed even when the salary offered for various positions is at or above the market rate for the position, suggesting the inflated sense of self-importance perpetuated by the Haredi tradition can lead to the development of ego, hindering Haredi men from accepting the work (Mendes, 2018).

Haredi males can be accused of nonassimilation, potentially functioning as the greatest barrier to employment in the United States (Mendes, 2018). The trends of nonassimilation place the responsibility of moneymaking on the women within Haredi households (Yaffe, McDonald, Halperin, & Saguy, 2018). One of the barriers to Haredi employment is the reversal of social norms and roles within these families, which do not mesh with current gender pay inequality in

the United States and abroad (Yaffe et al., 2018). The irony is, if Haredi males took on the responsibility of earning a household income, the men would be paid more than 20% more per hour than wives, but due to the emphasis of the role being placed on women, Haredi families are further limiting the ability to be financially stable (Yaffe et al., 2018).

Social work is one area in which Haredi men flourish, suggesting the form of educational attainment is far easier for the demographic (Ganz, 2019). Overall trends in community norms and values and lost idealizations of how people need to present themselves means many Haredi males are limited to working with other Haredi males (Ganz, 2019). To break these trends in Israel, the Tal Law was created in 2003 and allowed yeshiva students to defer military services. The law was created as a means of attempting to overcome the barrier of age, which limits many Haredi men from finding adequate employment. Haredi men are significantly less intellectual from a traditional, standardized educational perspective and cannot boast the same qualifications as non-Haredi peers; the Tal Law facilitated Haredi men in gaining appropriate qualifications at a younger age and perpetuate the ability to keep moving up the employment ladder (Deutsch, 2018).

Finally, the last barrier to employment observed in the literature on Haredi males is the finding fathers within these populations continue to perpetuate traditional Haredi gender norms, and young men are consistently born into cultures which do not value broader education but rather religious application (Wagner, 2017). Researchers termed the observed trend a form of *concealed fatherhood*, wherein the head of the household is revered but barely known by the children (Wagner, 2017). The major limitation of the research concerning the barriers to employment for Haredi males is the group has not been asked opinions regarding what has limited and shaped Haredim's transition into adulthood. Given the secluded and less qualified



nature of Haredi male job applicants and the continued deficiencies observed in terms of knowledge, culture, demand, and access to the mainstream culture (Ben-David Kolikant & Genut, 2017), more exploration into the barriers and challenges surrounding Haredi male integration into the job market was needed.

### **Chapter Summary**

The paradigm in research on Haredi males was characterized by the tendency to adhere to an insular, dated, archaic community demanding a lifestyle which contradicts what is typically demanded by the modern mainstream world. The emphasis placed on religious education was a major barrier to formal and practice aspects of employment, but cultural underpinnings within these communities suggest no great yearning for older Haredi men to help younger generations find work and evolve into the modern world. No evidence was found, other than self-reported data, indicating Haredi men in the United States make as much as Jewish peers. Given the insular nature of these communities, research was limited in general. The following chapter includes a discussion of the methodology employed in the study.

### **Chapter 3: Methodology**

While ultra-Orthodox Jewish (Haredi) males may possess several unique technical attributes and skills (e.g., manual dexterity) and soft skills (e.g., emotional stability, agreeableness, conscientiousness), the men often do not partake in traditional mainstream education and, as a result, do not fully develop core skills such as literacy and numeracy, which are considered central to attaining proper employment (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). An inadequate education provided by the Haredi education system hinders these individuals in finding gainful employment and substantially increases the risk of poverty and dependence on government subsidies (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). The problem addressed in the study was ultra-Orthodox Jewish males often enter the job market without adequate secondary and postsecondary education and experience high rates of unemployment as a result (Arlosoroff, 2016). The purpose of the study was to identify barriers hindering male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates in acquiring employment in the United States and to identify potential affordances which can help male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates overcome these barriers. The following research questions guided the study:

Research Question 1: How have male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates' religious and cultural beliefs influenced the attainment of employable skills?

Research Question 2: What are the barriers male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates face in acquiring employment?

Research Question 3: What are the strengths male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates bring to the job market; what skills do ultra-Orthodox Jewish males lack?

Research Question 4: How can male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates be more prepared to enter the job market?

Following is a discussion of the qualitative descriptive case study design on which the study was based and its rationale. Next, the chapter includes descriptions of the study population, intended study sample, and data collection procedure, followed by a description of the procedures used to ensure the internal and external validity of the findings. Discussion of the data analysis procedures and relevant ethical considerations follow.

### **Research Design and Rationale**

A qualitative descriptive case approach was used for the study. Quantitative approaches were considered, but a quantitative design would involve the collection of numerical data to identify statistical relationships between variables (Creswell & Creswell, 2017). A qualitative approach, which facilitates an open-ended exploration of participants' experiences and perceptions, was found to be more appropriate for the study (Creswell & Creswell, 2017). A qualitative design facilitates the collection of data about how participants interpret and assign meaning to personal experiences, as described in personal narrative form, within the district cultural contexts (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). A qualitative research design was appropriate for going beyond the problem of unemployment among ultra-Orthodox Jewish men to investigate the reasons associated with unemployment, which emerged from richly contextualized descriptions of experiences and perceptions and cannot be represented numerically.

A qualitative descriptive case study design was appropriate for describing participants' opinions and perceptions of external, real-world conditions, and processes (Percy et al., 2015). The phenomenon of interest indicated by the research questions included how male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates' religious and cultural beliefs influenced the

attainment of employable skills, the barriers preventing each graduate from obtaining employment, the strengths and weaknesses as employment candidates, and how each graduate can be better prepared to enter the job market. Participants were a stratified sample of males in the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community in the United States who are searching or have searched for jobs. Participants had the relevant experiences of and familiarity with the phenomenon of interest to provide useful data. The inclusion of multiple participants in the sample facilitated the identification of common themes across participants and the development of a robust description of the phenomenon of interest.

Qualitative descriptive case study is particularly appropriate when the research questions require a balanced focus on the internal and external components of an experience (Percy et al., 2015). In the study, relevant external, real-world conditions included participants' circumstances and capabilities, cultural conditions influencing skill development and education, and social and economic conditions influencing the nature and availability of jobs. Relevant internal conditions included participants' self-perceptions of strengths and weaknesses as well as participants' religious beliefs. Accordingly, a qualitative descriptive case study was selected.

### **Role of the Researcher**

As suggested by Percy et al. (2015), the role of the researcher in this study was to conduct participant recruitment procedures, interview participants, and analyze data to develop findings. No preexisting personal or professional relationship with any participant existed. No conflicts of interest on the part of the research itself or the participants were presented in the study, and no incentive was offered for participation to avoid influencing participants to give specific answers (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). The role of the researcher as the collector and analyst of the data created the potential for bias to threaten the confirmability of findings

(Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). To minimize the influence of any such preconceptions on the data analysis and findings, an inductive data analysis procedure was used as recommended by Creswell and Creswell (2017). To allow the reader to independently assess the confirmability of the findings, direct quotations from the data are included as evidence in the presentation of results (Percy et al., 2015).

### **Research Procedures**

The section includes a review of the procedures used in the study, including the population and sample of focus, instrumentation, and data collections process. Given the focus on the experiences and perceptions of participants in the study regarding an esoteric phenomenon, a purposeful sampling procedure was utilized to select a sample of ultra-Orthodox Jewish males who had firsthand experience searching for a job. The data collection process initially planned for collecting qualitative data via semi-structured interviews, handwritten field notes, and a supporting online questionnaire from which a thematic analysis was conducted. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, all interviews were conducted over the phone, making field notes unavailable as a data source.

### **Population and Sample Selection**

The study population included ultra-Orthodox Jewish males residing in one U.S. Haredi community. Approximately 126,000 Haredi-educated males in the United States identify as ultra-Orthodox (Greenberg, 2018), and formed the total target population of the study. *Haredim*, or ultra-Orthodox Jews, are Orthodox Jews who claim not to make any compromises with contemporary secular culture, who maintain social solidarity and a cultural distance from the surrounding secular society, and who refuse to adopt essential changes in the way Judaism is practiced from what tradition and halakhah sanctify. The Haredim also became distinguishable

by living in relatively insular communities, speaking Yiddish, sending children to yeshivas, arranging marriages, and being overwhelmingly endogamous (Wîgôder & Werblowsky, 1997).

Approximately 43% of Haredi households in New York live below the poverty line, and another 16% are close to the poverty line (Rosenberg, 2018). Haredi communities have a greater percentage of families receiving cash assistance, food stamps, public health-care coverage, and Section 8 housing vouchers, as compared to surrounding communities (Rosenberg, 2018). The percentage of people in Haredi communities utilizing public income support, such as cash assistance, Supplemental Security Income, and Medicaid has increased dramatically between 2007 and 2018 as the population grew rapidly without improvements in education (Rosenberg, 2018).

A purposeful sample population was recruited for the study. Purposeful sampling involves focusing recruitment efforts on individuals who are likely to have the experiences and knowledge necessary to provide relevant data (Palinkas et al., 2015). Purposeful sampling was appropriate for collecting as much relevant data as possible using limited resources and time (Palinkas et al., 2015).

The inclusion criteria for the sample included male Haredi, ultra-Orthodox Jews; at least 25 and no more than 55 years of age; educated exclusively in the United States at a yeshiva, whether at home or in another educational institution; out of school for at least 5 years, during which employment was sought in the United States; fluent in written and spoken English; and willing to participate in an audio-recorded interview. The sample included 10 participants, a sample size within the range recommended by Creswell and Creswell (2017) for qualitative studies. The exclusion criterion was a preexisting personal or professional relationship with the interviewer.

Recruitment was conducted by posting information about the study on social media platforms used by graduates of schools in the Orthodox community. The recruitment letter is presented in Appendix B. The posts included a brief description of the nature and purpose of the study, the inclusion and exclusion criteria, and an invitation for eligible individuals interested in joining or who have any questions to message the interviewer securely through the social media platform's messaging system. Individuals who were interested in the study initiated contact with the interviewer. No site permissions were needed.

The flyers used to invite participants in the study had researcher's contact information. Interested individuals messaged the interviewer and a preliminary screening phone call of about 5 minutes was scheduled based on participant's convenience. The call included a review of the purpose and nature of the study, followed by asking the potential participant whether he meets each of the prerequisites stated in the inclusion criteria. Interested individuals who could not verbally confirm meeting all inclusion criteria were thanked for their interest in the study, and no interview was scheduled. When interested individuals confirmed meeting all inclusion criteria, the terms of informed consent (Appendix A) were reviewed, and permission was sought to mail or e-mail the informed consent form to the participant. The participant was asked to sign the informed consent form after a discussion at the time of the interview. An interview was scheduled for a time and a place convenient for the participant.

Participant recruitment and data collection were concluded when data saturation was reached. Data saturation was reached when the collection and analysis of additional data ceased to yield new themes and insights (Fusch & Ness, 2015). Data saturation was achieved when 10 participants had been interviewed and analysis of one additional interview yielded no new themes or codes.

## **Instrumentation**

Interviews and a questionnaire were utilized as data collection sources. The interviews were conducted according to a researcher-developed guide consisting of open-ended questions to elicit responses relevant to answering the research questions. An interview protocol was essential for focusing the interview, directing the sequence of the questions, and steering clarifying questions while keeping the interview within the parameters of the study (Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). The semi-structured interview format allowed participants to describe the experiences and perceptions in their words while maintaining a focus on the phenomenon of interest and giving the interviewer the flexibility to ask probing follow-up questions as needed (Pearson, 2018).

The questionnaire was the second data source. The questionnaire was preceded by a page displaying the terms of informed consent and a request for the participant to either accept the terms to proceed or decline the terms to participate, which redirected the potential participant to a page thanking the participant for opting out of the study. Each participant who accepted the terms to participate was asked to enter his participant identifier from the e-mail with the link. Creswell and Creswell (2017) argued that questionnaire can help researchers collect additional demographic information that can support the understanding of the study results. Therefore, a demographic questionnaire was used to elicit information about each participant's age, current employment status, level and nature of education, and family status. Collecting the information will assist future researchers in assessing the transferability of the findings (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

The questionnaire included two open-ended questions for participants to answer in open-ended fields. The open-ended questions elicited information relevant to answering the research questions. Each participant's responses in the open-ended fields may be valuable when



triangulated with the same participant's interview responses because the questionnaire and interview were conducted at different times, when circumstantial influences irrelevant to the study topic may be different. Member checking was used to assess the truthfulness of the responses gathered from questionnaires by cross-checking and providing participants with the opportunity to tell whether the responses reflect their intended thoughts.

A field test using a panel of subject matter experts was conducted to ensure the interview questionnaire was consistent (Appendix C), clearly written, and addressed all questions comprising the research (Creswell & Creswell, 2017, p.37). The field test involved three researchers familiar with the topic who provided input regarding comfort level with the instrument via e-mail and any suggestions on how the instrumentation may be improved. All input from the field test was considered before proceeding with the data collection.

### **Data Collection**

Data were collected through one-to-one, semi-structured interviews and an online questionnaire. When a participant was recruited into the study, a link to the online questionnaire was e-mailed to the participant along with the alphanumeric code and a request to complete the questionnaire within 24 hours before the interview. If the questionnaire was not received on time, the interviewer e-mailed a reminder and offered to reschedule the interview if a participant could not complete the online questionnaire before the interview.

Interviews were conducted via phone on a date and at a time of the participant's choice. Interviews were audio recorded with a digital recording device to ensure accurate recording of data (Percy et al., 2015). At the beginning of the interview, the participant was reminded of the informed consent form and a printed description of the nature of the study. The participant was reminded participation is entirely voluntary and can be terminated at any point in the study

(Percy et al., 2015). Documents were reviewed with the participant over the phone, and the participant was invited to voice any questions or concerns. Once any questions or concerns were addressed, the participant was asked to approve verbally the informed consent form and the description of the nature of the study. The participant granted permission to turn on the recorder, and the interview began.

Semi-structured interviews were used to gather data, with probing follow-up questions when additional clarification or details were needed. At the end of the interview, the participant was asked if anything needed to be added to the responses. The recorder was then turned off and the participant was given the contact information for follow-ups in case any questions or concerns arose. The participants were also informed that a third-party company would be used to transcribe the interview files. The audio-recorded interviews will be stored for the mandated 3 year retention period on password-protected flash drives. At the end of the retention period, the flash drives containing the data will be destroyed.

### **Data Analysis**

Questionnaire data were compiled into a Microsoft Excel spreadsheet by the survey application. Close-ended items were analyzed descriptively using Excel's COUNTIF and percentage-calculation functions, and open-ended responses were analyzed thematically. Audio-recorded interviews were transcribed by a third party to avoid researcher bias from influencing the transcription process verbatim into Microsoft Word documents. Transcripts of the interviews were verified by reading each one while listening to the audio recording. All transcripts were de-identified by replacing the participants' real names with alphanumeric codes (such as P1, P2) assigned in the order in which the participants were interviewed and redacting any potentially identifying details. Protections to ensure confidentiality were also addressed. Interview

transcripts and open-ended questionnaire data were uploaded into NVivo 12 software for analysis.

Interview and open-ended questionnaire data were analyzed using the six-step thematic procedure described by Braun and Clarke (2006). Qualitative data analysis software such as NVivo does not automate the analysis process, but the software assisted in speeding up the analysis process and ensuring coded data excerpts were maintained in the intended pattern of organization (Leech & Onwuegbuzie, 2011). Braun and Clarke's six steps of data analysis are as follows: (a) reading and rereading the data in whole to gain familiarity, (b) coding the data by grouping passages expressing similar ideas, (c) theming the data by grouping similar codes, (d) reviewing and refining the themes, (e) naming and defining the themes, and (f) creating a presentation of results.

The analysis procedures were inductive, meaning themes and codes emerged through the identification of patterns in the data instead of being determined in advance (Terry, Hayfield, Clarke, & Braun, 2017). An inductive, thematic analysis procedure was appropriate for allowing unanticipated themes and insights to emerge from the data rather than imposing researcher-developed, deductive codes inappropriately distorting participants' intended meanings (Terry et al., 2017). The procedure was consistent with the study objective of achieving new insights into participants' experiences of the phenomenon of interest indicated by the research questions, without limiting the potential for new ideas and themes to emerge or filtering participants' responses through the interviewer's preconceptions.

### **Reliability and Validity**

The qualitative analogs of the quantitative constructs of reliability and validity were included in the four elements of trustworthiness identified by Fusch et al. (2018). The four

components of trustworthiness are credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability. The following subsections indicate the procedures used to strengthen each of the elements.

### **Credibility**

*Credibility* is the extent to which qualitative results accurately describe what the results are intended to describe (Fusch et al., 2018). Threats to credibility included inaccuracies in participants' responses and failure to accurately record data. Participant honesty was encouraged through procedures to ensure confidentiality. The accuracy of participants' responses was simultaneously facilitated by conducting interviews at a time and place of the participant's choice, to ensure the participant is comfortable and has ample time to reflect on responses and provide sufficient detail. Accurate recording of data was facilitated through audio recording the interviews and having the audio recordings transcribed verbatim and verifying the transcripts through comparison with the originals. Participants were also asked to review the respective transcript for accuracy and recommend corrections as appropriate.

### **Transferability**

*Transferability* is the extent to which results will be true of other populations and samples (Fusch et al., 2018). Generalizability is not a goal of qualitative research, and transferability of results based on geographically limited and numerically small samples was likely to be limited (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). To assist future researchers in assessing transferability, rich descriptions of the sample, research setting, and data were provided to the extent to which was compatible with confidentiality.

### **Dependability**

Results are dependable when replication is possible at a different time in the same research context (Fusch et al., 2018). The dependability of the results in the study was enhanced

by providing clear, detailed descriptions of the study procedures so other researchers can replicate the procedures if necessary. Accurate recording of data also contributed to dependability by minimizing errors under a counterfactual scenario where the study procedures would be replicated.

### **Confirmability**

Results are confirmable when reflecting on the opinions and perceptions of the participants rather than the researcher (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Confirmability was enhanced through the use of an inductive analysis procedure. The procedure minimized the influence of preconceptions on the results by allowing themes to emerge from the data instead of being predetermined (Terry et al., 2017). Confirmability was also enhanced through the inclusion of direct quotations from the data as evidence for all themes in the presentation of findings. The presentation of evidence allows the reader to assess confirmability independently. To overcome the effects of research bias, the investigator stated within the study personal assumptions, beliefs, and opinions relating to the topic to avoid conflict of interest.

### **Ethical Procedures**

Approval was received from the university's Institutional Review Board (IRB) before recruitment efforts began. Ethical procedures were implemented to ensure the protection of human subjects. Participants were informed on any recruitment materials and again during initial contact with the interviewer regarding the voluntary nature of participation in the study and the freedom to leave the study at any time or refuse to answer any interview question, for any reason, which need not be stated. Participants were also informed there will be no negative consequences for withdrawing from the study.

Informed consent was obtained from participants by reviewing a copy of the IRB-approved informed consent form with each participant at the time of the interview, inviting the participant to ask questions or express concerns, addressing all questions and concerns to the participant's satisfaction, and then obtaining the participant's signature on the informed consent form before any data were collected (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2019). Participants were informed of no known risks to participating in the study beyond those associated with everyday activities (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2019). Participants were also informed no benefits were associated with participation in the study beyond contributing insights, which may help ultra-Orthodox Jewish males be better prepared to enter the job market.

All reasonable efforts were made to keep the participants' identities confidential. Participants were invited to choose a location for the interview where adequate privacy was assured. Audio recordings of the interviews were downloaded from the recording device onto a password-protected flash drive to which only the interviewer had access; the recordings were then deleted from the recording device. Transcripts were de-identified by replacing participants' names with alphanumeric codes (such as P1, P2) and redacting potentially identifying details. One handwritten key indicating the code assigned to each participant was created. The key, the flash drive, and the signed informed consent forms were stored in a locked filing cabinet in a private office to which only the researcher had access. As supported by Lincoln and Guba (1985), the flash drive, handwritten key, and signed informed consent forms will be destroyed at the end of the required retention period of 3 years.

### **Chapter Summary**

The chapter included a description of the qualitative descriptive case study design. Procedural descriptions indicated a purposeful sample of 10 male ultra-Orthodox Jews was recruited and data collection occurred through one-to-one, semi-structured interviews guided by a researcher-developed interview guide. Participants completed an online questionnaire through a survey application to provide demographic information and answer open-ended questions for with interview data. Interviews were audio recorded, and the audio recordings and open-ended questionnaire responses were transcribed verbatim and uploaded into NVivo 12 software for analysis. Interview transcripts and open-ended questionnaire data were analyzed using a six-step inductive thematic procedure. Ethical procedures were implemented to ensure participation in the study was entirely voluntary, participants gave informed consent of participation, and participants' identities were kept confidential. Chapter 4 includes the results of the data collection and analysis.

## **Chapter 4: Research Findings and Data Analysis Results**

In the United States, many Haredim choose to send children to yeshivas, private religious schools focusing primarily on studying Jewish texts, rather than traditional private schools or public schools which opt for more standard educational guidelines (Greenberg, 2018). Reports from yeshiva graduates challenge the quality of the education received at yeshivas. In 2015, the New York City Board of Education launched investigations into educational neglect in yeshivas (Matthews & Frost, 2015). In 2018, the state of New York was sued for allegedly turning a blind eye to educational mismanagement in yeshivas and allowing yeshivas to continue teaching a curriculum lacking courses in the core competencies (English, math, U.S. history, and science; Greenberg, 2018). The absence of these secular courses means many ultra-Orthodox Jews do not have the skills necessary to become productive employees (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). The purpose of the qualitative descriptive case study was to explore how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education, using a sample of 10 Haredi males in the United States, via semi-structured interviews. To address the purpose, the following research questions guided the study:

Research Question 1: How have male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates' religious and cultural beliefs influenced the attainment of employable skills?

Research Question 2: What are the barriers male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates face in acquiring employment?

Research Question 3: What are the strengths male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates bring to the job market; what skills do ultra-Orthodox Jewish males lack?



Research Question 4. How can male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates be more prepared to enter the job market?

The data collection process used in the study is described first. A discussion of the data analysis and results follows. Next, the reliability and validity of the study are presented. Finally, the chapter ends with a summary.

### **Data Collection**

A purposeful sample of 10 participants was recruited for participation in an interview and open-ended questionnaire. The plan was to recruit 10 participants for semi-structured interviews. Participants were selected based on the following criteria: male Haredi; at least 25 and no more than 55 years of age; educated exclusively in the United States at a yeshiva, whether at home or in another educational institution; out of school for at least 5 years, during which employment was sought in the United States; fluent in written and spoken English; and willing to participate in a face-to-face, audio-recorded interview. The criteria were selected to recruit individuals who were likely to have the experiences and knowledge necessary to provide relevant data to answer the research questions (Palinkas et al., 2015).

Participants were between 26 and 42 years of age. The 10 participants had an average of 1.9 years of education and 8.2 years of work experience, while 70% of participants were employed. Table 1 details participant demographics.

Table 1

*Participant Demographics*

Participant code	Employment status	Age	Years of education	Years of employment
P1	Seeking work	29	1	8
P2	Employed	26	3	5
P3	Employed	31	5	9
P4	Seeking work	34	0	7
P5	Seeking work	27	0	6
P6	Employed	42	0	12
P7	Employed	31	2	9
P8	Employed	33	4	8
P9	Employed	37	4	10
P10	Employed	28	0	8

Recruitment was conducted in 1 month by posting information about the study on social media platforms used by graduates of schools in the Orthodox community. The last interview with P10 was conducted 3 months after the initial interviews due to insufficient recruitment during the first round of interviews. The posts included a brief description of the nature and purpose of the study, the inclusion and exclusion criteria, and an invitation for eligible individuals interested in joining or who have any questions to message the interviewer securely through the social media platform's messaging system. Individuals who were interested in the study initiated contact with the interviewer. An informed consent was secured for each potential participant by assuring each participant the data would be kept confidential and no harm was expected to result based on participation in the study. Participants were informed of the option to

decline answering any questions or withdrawing from the study at any time. Participants were asked to sign the informed consent form at the time of the interview. Receiving informed consent from all participants and collecting the study data took approximately one month.

### **Instrumentation**

The interviews were intended to be conducted in person. The interested individual made contact and met the study inclusion criteria, a phone interview was scheduled at the person's convenience. Potential participants received a consent form via e-mail prior to beginning the interview, to be signed and returned. The collection of the online questionnaire data was not affected by COVID-19. The questionnaire was administered through SurveyMonkey. The questionnaire link was e-mailed to the potential participants after contacting the researcher to express interest in the study. The time of recruitment, including an alphanumeric code (P1, P2, etc.), which was the participant's identifier throughout the study. The questionnaire was used to gather demographic data such as age, income and education level. After contacting the researcher, recruited participants signed an informed consent. All participants gave consent. Next, each participant was asked to enter his participant identifier from the e-mail with the link.

### **Data Analysis and Results**

Audio-recorded interviews were transcribed by a third party to avoid researcher bias from influencing the transcription process verbatim into Microsoft Word documents. Transcripts of the interviews were then verified by reading each one while listening to the audio recording. All transcripts were de-identified by replacing the participants' names with alphanumeric codes (P1, P2, etc.) assigned in the order in which the participants were interviewed and by redacting any potentially identifying details.

Interview transcripts and open-ended questionnaire data were uploaded into NVivo 12 software for analysis. The data were analyzed using the six-step thematic procedure described by Braun and Clarke (2006). Qualitative data analysis software, such as NVivo, does not automate the analysis process, but the software can assist in speeding up the analysis process and ensuring coded data excerpts are maintained in the intended pattern of organization (Leech & Onwuegbuzie, 2011). Braun and Clarke's six-step data analysis process includes (a) reading and rereading the data in whole to gain familiarity, (b) coding the data by grouping passages expressing similar ideas, (c) theming the data by grouping similar codes, (d) reviewing and refining the themes, (e) naming and defining the themes, and (f) creating a presentation of results.

The analysis procedure was inductive, meaning themes and codes emerged through the identification of patterns in the data instead of being determined in advance (Terry et al., 2017). An inductive thematic analysis procedure was appropriate for allowing unanticipated themes and insights to emerge from the data rather than imposing researcher-developed, deductive codes inappropriately distorting participants' intended meanings (Terry et al., 2017). The procedure was consistent with the study objective of achieving new insights into participants' experiences of the phenomenon of interest indicated by the research questions, without limiting the potential for new ideas and themes to emerge or filtering participants' responses through the interviewer's preconceptions.

Several major themes emerged from the data. One of the most prevalent themes was the idea a lack of competitive education and other culture-related restrictions reduced male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates' ability to compete in the job market. The theme arose in all the interviews. Not all participants believed their education prepared them to enter

the job market; in fact, many indicated it did not. However, almost all participants believed Haredi men bring strong soft skills to the workplace. Soft skills were often difficult to quantify, such as strong management, teamwork, and communication skills. Most participants believed religion and culture negatively affected their ability to access secondary school education. To address this issue, most participants believed integrating into mainstream society would improve ultra-Orthodox Jewish men's prospects when the men enter the workforce. The themes are described in Table 2.

Table 2

*Major Themes in the Data*

Theme	No. participants	Related research question
Religion and culture negatively affected participants' ability to access secondary school education.	7	RQ1
A lack of competitive education and other culture-related restrictions reduced male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates' ability to compete in the job market.	10	RQ2
Haredi men's employable strengths include soft skills often difficult to quantify, such as strong management, teamwork, and communication skills.	9	RQ3
Integrating into mainstream society would improve ultra-Orthodox Jewish men's prospects when the men enter the workforce.	8	RQ4

## Research Question 1

Research Question 1 was: How have male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates' religious and cultural beliefs influenced the attainment of employable skills? According to the interviews, participants believed religion and culture had negatively affected

their ability to access secondary school education. Sixty percent of participants ( $n = 6$ ) indicated a disbelief that Haredi men educated in yeshivas were likely to succeed in gaining competitive employment. The most stated reason for the perception among the participants ( $n = 5$ ) was the “performance gap” between themselves and other individuals in the workplace. P6 described the sentiment by saying:

I found that employers are reluctant to recruit super-Orthodox experts due to their generally weak educational foundation. Indeed, even those Haredi candidates who have received professional education are likely to get this degree, not in the advanced first-class education in institutions, but still considered to be one of the super-Orthodox universities of lower quality.

Like P6, P2 reported difficulty competing in the job market. P2 reported the skills learned in yeshivas do not necessarily compare to skills learned from other education systems. According to P2:

I find it troublesome to compete with young non-Haredi Jews. This is because, from their training focus, it can be inferred that there is a gap between Haredi and non-Haredi Jews. We the Haredi people study in religious schools full-time until about 40 years old.

Like other participants, P10 indicated that educational and culture issues made it difficult for Haredi Jews to maintain employment. P10 discussed issues related to educational gaps, such as a lack of understanding of math and science to cultural gaps such as language barriers. P10 said,

From low societal proficiency in Hebrew or any other related language to wide educational/cultural gaps, I could see that being a Haredi was heavily influenced by these factors in various controversial ways that can only point to integration. The huge

academic, gender as well as economic gaps, let alone competing with the non-Haredi Jews can only be eliminated through integrating these minority groups with these issues.

Other obstacles reported by participants include a lack of understanding or support of common networking techniques, such as the Internet. By not using the Internet to find jobs, most Haredi men have no choice but to rely on word of mouth. The issue is further exacerbated by the tendency to remain in isolated communities, putting the individuals at a disadvantage in the job search outside of the direct community. According to P7:

I believe that our Haredi job searchers have never thought of many vacancies because they only consume sector media and live in isolated communities, which are usually withdrawn from the global information stream. Many super-Orthodox churches do not advocate the use of the Internet. In the absence of family associations and informal organizations in the labor market, super-Orthodox Christians are even more reluctant to obtain oral reports on available positions or vacancies outside the region.

## **Research Question 2**

Research Question 2 was: What are the barriers male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates face in acquiring employment? During the interviews, participants discussed barriers related to education, such as language proficiency and lack of core academic training. According to P1, “My main challenge has been the low proficiency in the Hebrew language, which reduces my opportunities in the labor market.” P8 likewise reported difficulties due to language barriers:

Because of the language, I think it is difficult to explore high-level public spaces around the world. Yiddish is still the mother tongue of some Hashidians in the super-Orthodox world, although most of us super-Orthodox Jews do speak “Hebrew.” We do not speak

Hebrew with all the most advanced social references, expressions, and languages. Our oblivion to the methods and standards of the mainstream world makes it difficult for us to integrate into the social sphere.

Many participants agreed with P1 and P8, indicating a lack of competitive education reduced their ability to compete in the job market. Other cultural restrictions, such as shortened working hours and the need to maintain gender divisions, represented barriers to obtaining employment. P4 said:

As a male, I believe that our lifestyle has increased the burden on us. We have shorter working hours. Short working hours reduce current profits, and break through the potential for professional development, especially in the technology field. Not working for long working hours and poor adaptability is a big challenge for me.

P5 faced similar cultural barriers as P4. P5 found Haredi restrictions around food and gender mixing impacted his ability to acquire and maintain employment. According to P5:

I found that most managers are reluctant to recruit super-Orthodox workers because they are worried about adjusting the working environment. So, representatives can choose to abide by his/her religious commitments; these changes include real food and gender divisions. Haredi males cannot mix with women, hence cannot sit in the same workspace.

### **Research Question 3**

Research Question 3 was: What are the strengths male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates bring to the job market; what skills do ultra-Orthodox Jewish male lack? Interview participants were reluctant to attribute concrete strengths to the Haredi education system as related to the job market. Reported strengths Haredi men bring to the job market included soft skills often difficult to quantify, such as strong management, teamwork, and



communication skills. Participants reported strengths related to discipline and positive work engagement. P10 succinctly summed up the importance of soft skills when he discussed the strengths he brought to the job market. P10 said, “I had a keen interest in soft and life skills that I can arguably confirm have proven to be lifesaving towards becoming employable as a Haredi Jew.”

Interview themes related to Haredi men’s well-developed soft skills were validated in the questionnaire responses. The questionnaire asked participants to describe the strengths male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary graduates bring to the job market. Six participants indicated Haredi men have a propensity for hard work and commitment. P1 stated, “I believe the male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary graduates bring hard work and commitment to the job market.” P10 said, “They are often taught to believe in hard work and competency.” P3 also mentioned commitment, saying, “The male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary graduates bring honesty and commitment to work. They are often the earliest members of the staff [to arrive in the morning] in most workplaces.” These and other skills are described in Table 3.

Table 3

*Strengths Haredi Men Bring to the Job Market*

Strength	No. participants
A propensity for hard work and commitment	6
Honesty	2
Strong written communication skills	2
Leadership potential	1
Detail-oriented	1

Unlike the questionnaire responses, most soft skills mentioned in the interviews were mentioned by a single participant. In the interviews, religious understanding was the most referenced skill brought to the job market by male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates. Fifty percent of participants ( $n = 5$ ) indicated religious understanding to be the primary strength. In speaking of strengths, P8 said, “I have gained the skills to describe and set the type of religious expression by clarifying its importance to work and establishing relationships with religious customs.” P9 expressed a similar sentiment by saying, “I think I must show the skill to find the relationship between religious expressions and the social conditions of other places on the Earth by establishing a more comprehensive internal and external understanding.”

The interviews contained more consensus about the skills ultra-Orthodox Jewish men lack when entering the job market. Nearly a third of participants ( $n = 3$ ) indicated a lack of family resources is a hindrance when entering the job market because Haredi families are less likely to be able to afford academic guidance for children. P5 said, “I think that among the Haredi people, the impact of parental income on obtaining recognition, which undoubtedly increases the possibility of obtaining academic guidance, is several times higher than that of non-Haredi Jews.” P8 expressed a similar sentiment to P5, saying Haredi families cannot afford to send children to the most prestigious training schools preparing the children for quality jobs. Haredi schools operate on a closed system, perpetuating struggles in finding employment outside of the system. P8 said:

I note that the basic training results at the intersection of sociopolitical environments and large-scale methods and practices have a limit. The Haredi Jewish graduates cannot

afford to join the best training schools in and globally because of ignorance. The schools operate as a closed system.

Another near third of participants ( $n = 3$ ) indicated a lack of foundational academic skills is a weakness among Haredi men. P6 said the gap in test scores during school prevents Haredi individuals from continuing education. P6 stated:

I observe that many Haredi students regard [standardized] tests as an important obstacle to integrating into higher education. Although the gap between the normal test scores of Jews and Haredis is gradually narrowing, it remains around 100, which reminds people that the absolute score is 800. The gaps in the English part are particularly prominent. This is because the Haredi system fails to teach us English and other necessary skills to compete fairly.

P12 indicated the lack of educational attainment may arise from schools' budgetary restrictions. P12 believed Haredi schools lack the means to provide both a religious and secular education and prioritize the religious component. According to P12:

I believe the Haredi schools are facing budgetary difficulties in providing the additional basic considerations required by these students. These schools do not provide support for students with the learning skill, yet the students here need a lot of help. These problems are related to writing and detailing. They are not comprehensive in covering the necessary life skills courses. Such a system promotes a culture of laziness. We, therefore, find it hard to fit in the fast-paced society.

#### **Research Question 4**

Research Question 4 inquired: How can male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates be more prepared to enter the job market? According to the interviews, 80% of

participants ( $n = 8$ ) believed further integrating into mainstream society would improve ultra-Orthodox Jewish men's prospects when the men enter the workforce. Ideas are described in Table 4.

*Strategies to Better Prepare Haredi Men to Enter the Job Market*

Strategy	No. participants
Further integrate into mainstream society	8
Encouraging students to take greater responsibility for mistakes and shortcomings	3
Encouraging greater parent involvement during their education	1

Participants who believed Haredi graduates need to take responsibility for shortcomings rejected the idea external barriers, such as discrimination or lack of opportunity, prevent Haredi men from finding employment. P2 stated, "I believe Haredi graduates must learn to admit defeat when mistakes are discovered and fixing them are a priority. They are not rationalized or discriminated. We are responsible and fix its problems only if we are open-minded."

In relating to the need to further integrate with mainstream society, the 7 participants who discussed the sentiment in interviews largely believed Haredi schools teach students to exist in a closed society, hampering graduates' abilities to find employment outside of the Haredi society. P10 expressed the notion by saying, "I believe, in the corporate world, cooperation is the way to prosperity. I look for graduates in a project that can work with others. The Haredi schools are teaching their students to live in closed societies."

P9 said something similar to P10, indicating isolationist thinking ultimately hurts students who need to find employment after graduation. While P9 indicated he gained several positive

work habits during his education, he was frustrated by some of his peers who believe religious beliefs set the individuals apart from society at large. P9 explained:

I think if I check my references and background, I find my work attitude is shaped largely by my previous school. How I treat others and where I come from shape this diligent attitude. I find it hard to deal with some Haredi graduates who feel entitled and have their religion as the yardstick that is better than the rest. The schools should be liberal in their teaching.

The interview theme of needing to integrate into larger society was supported in the questionnaire responses. Four participants indicated, to better prepare to enter the job market, Haredi men should embrace more practical aspects of mainstream culture. P1 said, “The ultra-Orthodox Jewish graduates can be more prepared to enter the job market by learning the technical aspects of different fields which are not restricted by their culture.” In close agreement with P1, P4 said, “The graduates should consider embracing other cultures apart from their religious beliefs, to be more prepared for the job market.”

Other more infrequently mentioned strategies in the questionnaire included further education, improving ability to communicate, and embracing work. Two participants said Haredi men could undergo additional education by taking college courses or receiving additional technical training. P6 said, “The graduates could also start undertaking professional training and courses besides their basic secondary education to prepare for the job market.” Another two participants stated Haredi men could improve their communication skills to better interact with their coworkers. P8 believed more effective communication is necessary, while P9 believed Haredi men could learn additional languages. Finally, two participants believed Haredi men could better prepare for the job market by thinking of work as a career rather than just a way to

earn money. P2 said, “Most ultra-Orthodox men only see their jobs as a source of livelihood but could look at employment as a long-term successful career.” One participant (P10) believed Haredi men would be more prepared to enter the workforce if they more strictly adhered to required timelines and budgets.

### **Reliability and Validity**

The qualitative analogs of the quantitative constructs of reliability and validity are included in the four elements of trustworthiness, identified by Fusch et al. (2018). The four components of trustworthiness are credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability. The following subsections indicate the procedures used to strengthen each of the elements.

#### **Credibility**

Credibility is the extent to which qualitative results accurately describe what the results are intended to describe (Fusch et al., 2018). Threats to credibility include inaccuracies in participants’ responses and failure to accurately record data. Participant honesty was encouraged through procedures to ensure confidentiality, such as assigning pseudonyms to participants and maintaining data security in a password-protected computer. The accuracy of participants’ responses was facilitated by conducting interviews at a time of the participant’s choice to ensure the participant had ample time to reflect on responses and provide sufficient detail. The interviews were intended to be conducted in person but were performed over the phone instead due to the COVID-19 pandemic. Participants were able to take the phone call at any location of their choosing, ensuring comfort in the interview environment. Accurate recording of data was facilitated through audio recording of the interviews, transcribing the audio recordings verbatim, and verifying the transcripts through comparison with the original recordings. Participants were

asked to review the respective transcripts for accuracy and recommend corrections as appropriate. No participant made corrections to any transcript.

### **Transferability**

Transferability is the extent to which results are true of other populations and samples (Fusch et al., 2018). Generalizability is not a goal of qualitative research, and transferability of results based on geographically limited and numerically small samples is likely to be limited (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). To assist future researchers in assessing transferability, rich descriptions of the sample were provided, in addition to the research setting and data in the chapter. As much information on study participants and the data collected were provided without jeopardizing participant anonymity.

### **Dependability**

Results are dependable when replication is possible at a different time in the same research context (Fusch et al., 2018). The dependability of the results in the study was enhanced by providing clear, detailed descriptions of the study procedures in a way that other researchers can replicate the procedures. Accurate recording of data further contributed to dependability by minimizing errors under a counterfactual scenario where the study procedures are replicated. The procedures used in the study to assure future researchers can closely replicate the study were carefully documented.

### **Confirmability**

Results are confirmable when the findings reflect the opinions and perceptions of the participants (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Confirmability was enhanced using an inductive analysis procedure. The procedure minimizes the influence of preconceptions on the results by allowing themes to emerge from the data instead of being predetermined (Terry et al., 2017).

Confirmability was similarly enhanced through the inclusion of direct quotations from the data as evidence for all themes in the presentation of findings. The presentation of evidence could allow the reader to assess confirmability independently. To overcome the effects of research bias in the study, one can state personal assumptions, beliefs, and opinions relating to the topic to avoid conflict of interests (Terry et al., 2017). Personal assumptions, beliefs, and opinions relating to the topic include a strong concern for ultra-Orthodox men lacking a modern education struggle to earn enough money to make employment worthwhile as opposed to relying on a social welfare system. The opinion was mitigated during data collection and analysis to avoid biasing the study.

### **Chapter Summary**

The purpose of the qualitative descriptive case study was to explore how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education, using a sample of 10 Haredi males in the United States, via semi-structured interviews. Sixty percent of participants in the interviews ( $n = 6$ ) indicated Haredi men educated in yeshivas were unlikely to succeed in gaining competitive employment. The most stated reason for the perception among the participants ( $n = 5$ ) was the “performance gap” between themselves and other individuals in the workplace.

Barriers faced by the participants were answered and data emerged from the findings. Participants reported barriers relating to language proficiency, lack of core education, cultural restrictions, discrimination, and having large families. Of these reported barriers, lack of core education was the most stated. Participants additionally reported strengths related to discipline and positive work engagement. Participants reported ultra-Orthodox Jewish males lack the necessary familial resources to obtain high-quality services and supports and foundational education to obtain employment. Preparing males for the job market was included in the research



questions. According to the interviews, the majority answer to the question was to further integrate into mainstream society. The theme was supported by questionnaire responses, in which participants indicated further integration into mainstream society was an opportunity for improvement.

Detailed results of the study were revealed in the chapter. Discussion of the limitations of the study as well as recommendations for future research is included in the following chapter. The findings are discussed in conjunction with the available literature to draw conclusions. Conclusions regarding the study's implication for leadership are additionally presented.

## **Chapter 5: Discussion and Conclusion**

The purpose of the qualitative descriptive case study was to explore how cultural and religious factors act as barriers to education using a sample of 10 Haredi males in the United States. The targeted participants were recruited through purposeful sampling. The study population was ultra-Orthodox Jewish males residing in one U.S. Haredi community. The population was chosen due to easy accessibility. The following sections include the research findings, interpretations and conclusions, limitations, recommendations, and implications of the study.

Participants indicated religion and cultural beliefs affected their ability to access secondary education. From the interview data, participants likely meant access to secondary school was negatively affected by aspects of religion and culture. In addition, 80% of the participants indicated the skills learned in secondary school did not aid the participants in obtaining an employable skill set.

During the interviews, participants discussed barriers related to education, such as language proficiency and lack of core academic training. Additional barriers identified by the participants included cultural restrictions, discrimination, and having large families. The study's overarching objectives were to inform the academic community of existing barriers and to identify approaches to be taken by the Haredi school system as well as the Haredi community to better prepare students for the job market.

### **Findings**

Interview participants described perspectives indicating Haredi education does not teach strengths related to preparing students for the job market. The reported strengths Haredi men bring to the job market include soft skills often difficult to quantify, such as strong management,

teamwork and communication skills. Religious understanding is the primary focus of ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates.

Participants reported the best way for Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates to be prepared for the job market is through further integration into mainstream society. Participants believed further integrating into mainstream society would improve ultra-Orthodox Jewish men's prospects in the workforce. A few participants reported the importance of the length of education received, improving the ability to communicate, and adapting a better mindset toward a career in general.

### **Research Question 1**

The first research Question was: How have male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates' religious and cultural beliefs influenced the attainment of employable skills? Based on results of the study, cultural and religious beliefs affect the quality of education individuals in ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools receive, negatively affecting the level of employable skills. The findings are consistent with Katzir and Perry-Hazan (2019), who argued education infrastructure within Jewish schools has been based on those built by previous religious organizations and leaders to enhance education. Facilities largely promote the spread of religious faith as well as education, through which students can achieve better skills for employment. The curriculum of ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools discourages secular education, resulting in students with less employable skills. The education system is focused on cultural practices, religious beliefs, and legal canons (Levin, 2018). Religion has been the main reason for the establishment and development of religious schools across the United States, which are run by faith groups such as Catholics and Quakers. Schools are responsible for the education of immigrants (Katzir & Perry-Hazan, 2019).

In line with the results of the study, Genut and Ben-David Kolikant (2017) noted ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school students recorded low grades as compared to students in other religions. Ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school students were found to have GPAs 2.33 points lower than students from other religions (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). The poor results in school translate to a lack of employable skills, which are important in the highly competitive job market across the United States. The national employment analysis indicated the majority of ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates were unemployed (Genut & Ben-David Kolikant, 2017). The most educated people in the United States are those who are less religious, as less religious individuals tend to be able to focus more on employable skills and are more detail-oriented than devoutly religious individuals (Waksman, 2019). Frequent and deep religious and cultural practices have been associated with low educational aspirations. Waksman (2019) found Jewish students spend much time learning about traditions and religious beliefs, leaving little time for secular education. As such, Gabbay et al. (2017) argued, the limited time set aside for formal learning makes the students unsuitable for employment. Jewish religion views education as personal knowledge and individual enhancement. Students are required to individually work hard to achieve better performance in school.

## **Research Question 2**

The second research question was: What are the barriers male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates face in acquiring employment? The barriers male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates face in acquiring employment include lack of language proficiency, lack of core education, cultural restrictions, discrimination, and having large families. High unemployment among the ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduate participants was attributed to a lack of basic employable skills. According to Vivod (2019),

language proficiency increases the probability of securing employment. High unemployment has been attributed to poor language proficiency and communication skills. Good communication skills are important in the workplace as the skills ensure a smooth flow of information and instructions. Communication skills are critical in avoiding and solving workplace conflicts (Vivod, 2019). Feedback from the media industry has shown graduates from ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools lack the necessary language and communication skills for the workplace (Braun-Lewensohn & Kalagy, 2019). Individuals cannot speak confidently during oral presentations, impacting their potential to even be considered by employers.

As identified in the study, cultural restriction is another barrier male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduate's face in acquiring employment. Culture influences the management of human resources, job recruitment, leadership styles, and decision-making. Additionally, culture affects managerial functions, such as motivation, work design, communication, and the employment process. In the United States, race-based discrimination within the employment sector has resulted in high unemployment rates among Jewish secondary school graduates. Due to the focus on religious and traditional teachings, Jewish students have been found to have less employable skills as compared to other secular students. According to Waksman (2019), racial discrimination causes poor health, mental issues, and depression among ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates. Workplace discrimination has been associated with poor work quality, work conflicts, lack of commitment, increased cynicism, and employee turnover.

Core education equips students with necessary skills to remain competitive in the job market. According to Dehan (2013), core education involves the courses students should complete before graduating from school. The education provides students with knowledge

important in handling workplace duties. As found in the study, male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates do not get enough core education as the Jewish school curriculum focuses more on religious and traditional teachings. As opposed to Jewish schools, traditional schools provide knowledge in different fields, including arts, computer, physical education, health, and different world languages. According to Taras, Steel, and Kirkman (2016), knowledge in different sectors allows graduates to be well equipped for the dynamic work environment. Furthermore, core education ensures learners take courses considered culturally and academically essential.

### **Research Question 3**

The third research question 3 was: What are the strengths male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates bring to the job market; what skills do ultra-Orthodox Jewish male lack? According to the findings from the study, Haredi education does not teach strengths preparing students for the job market. Ultra-Orthodox students have come under scrutiny for not learning marketable skills contributing to tangible developments in the U.S. economy. The findings were in line with Wagner (2017), who found ultra-Orthodox secondary school students were behind in important subjects such as mathematics. Ultra-Orthodox secondary school systems focus more on religious and sectarian conflicts among individuals. Ultra-Orthodox secondary schools have little government oversight, making it difficult for the schools to include nonreligious studies in the curriculum (Taras et al., 2016).

Depending on the type of ultra-Orthodox school attended, some students acquire more employable skills than others. Young Advocates for Fair Education (YAFFED) was founded in 2012 to help ultra-Orthodox secondary school students acquire employable skills. According to Taras et al. (2016), the strategy of YAFFED is to encourage ultra-Orthodox secondary school

graduates to send old report cards and speak out about the skills they are lacking. The leadership of ultra-Orthodox secondary schools does not advocate for secular education. Students do not even understand the civil rights issues the United States has faced. Detaching these graduates from the real world makes it difficult for these individuals to have the skills for the job market.

The U.S. Department of Education is responsible for enhancing and ensuring education standards are upheld in all schools across the country, including private and ultra-Orthodox secondary schools. Due to poor politics, the leadership of schools has been rendered powerless in implementing these rules (Vivod, 2019). According to Seginer and Mahajna (2018), superintendents, who are tasked with overseeing school activities, are often compromised by the local board of education when issues such as lack of secular education are raised. The board of education has little intention of changing the education system in ultra-Orthodox schools. In Rockland County, a majority of the ultra-Orthodox secondary schools are located in East Ramapo. In the district of East Ramapo, the ultra-Orthodox schools have teamed up to hire a superintendent. It is difficult for such a superintendent to raise the alarm for the poor education students receive in the region (Seginer & Mahajna, 2018). Legislation has been passed requiring both ultra-Orthodox and private schools to provide the same quality and quantity of education as provided in public schools. The legislation was intended to ensure both public and private school students acquire the same employable skills (Seginer & Mahajna, 2018). According to the theoretical framework used in this study, social cognitive theory, the strengths and behaviors male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates bring to the job market depends on what they learned in school. Due to a poor education system lacking secular education, ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates develop little employable skills and behaviors.

#### **Research Question 4**

The fourth research question was: How can male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates be more prepared to enter the job market? The results of the study showed integration into mainstream society would improve ultra-Orthodox Jewish men's prospects when entering the workforce. Haredi education in ultra-Orthodox schools focuses more on religious beliefs than core education, creating difficulty for the graduates in socially and economically integrating with students from other religions. To prepare male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates for real work demands, some level of integration into modern society is necessary. As Russo-Netzer and Bergman (2019) argued, the integration should involve greater enrollment into universities, active roles in the workforce, and creation of forums through which students from ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools can express personal issues. Having such integration would bring help in the country where Haredim is on the rise. Once ultra-Orthodox schools' graduates are transformed to meet the employment demands, access to employment opportunities for ultra-Orthodox Jewish communities can be enhanced. According to Russo-Netzer and Bergman, integration of ultra-Orthodox school graduates across the United States is low. The graduates lack adequate employable skills, making it difficult to attain employment.

The findings from the study were echoed by Rosenberg (2018), who shared further integration of ultra-Orthodox students into the real world is a necessity. With the increasing technological advancements, individuals require more skills to cope with changes within organizations; hence, programs aimed at enhancing the skills of students after graduation from ultra-Orthodox Jewish schools are needed. The Pew Research Center (2013) shared one of the biggest challenges facing ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates is integration into higher education. The ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary education system leaves students



unprepared, and the students cannot receive any secular education. The students experience one of the biggest knowledge gaps as compared to students in other schools (Pew Research Center, 2013). In addition, ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary students do not have study skills and are unprepared to take tests.

In addition to the academic challenges ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates experience, several social challenges exist. Perry-Hazan and Perelstain (2018) highlighted the main issue for these graduates is being accepted by coworkers and superiors. Another integration challenge is resistance from the leaders in ultra-Orthodox Jewish schools. The leaders maintain taking part in modern education means taking big steps toward secularization and forgetting one's religious beliefs. As shown in the study, the ideal solution is to strive for a balance between secular education and maintaining ultra-Orthodox Jewish values in schools. The dichotomy is evident in the United States, where some individuals from ultra-Orthodox communities work as entrepreneurs, doctors, and lawyers. According to Perelman et al. (2019), Haredi culture can be protected even if secular education is introduced to equip students with real work skills.

### **Limitations**

In the study, the sample size was limited to 10 ultra-Orthodox Jewish males. The figure was a small percentage of the approximately 126,000 ultra-Orthodox Haredi-educated males. The quality of the data and the number of interviews determine the amount of usable data. Qualitative interviews generate a large amount of data. An inverse relationship exists between the amount of usable data and the number of participants needed. Toyé, Williamson, Williams, Fairbank, and Lamb (2016) recommended 6 to 30 participants for an ethnographic study. The sample group was selected from carefully screened volunteers but was not random, meaning the

sample was limited in its generalizability of application to other geographic areas and scope not covered by the study.

The study lacks generalizability, controls, and the ability to manipulate variables. The theory focused on processes of learning, and in doing so, disregards biological predispositions potentially influencing behaviors, regardless of experience and expectations. The model does not focus on emotion or motivation, other than through reference to experience, as the constructs are not elements of the study's problem statement and purpose. As a whole, the theory can be far-reaching and thus difficult to operationalize in its entirety.

### **Recommendations**

Several recommendations are provided for practice potentially important in increasing the employable skills of male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates. First, the U.S. government may use the study findings to improve oversight on how education is handled both in private and public schools. A change in education policies can ensure a similar curriculum is used both in private and public schools regardless of cultural and religious beliefs. Second, the selection of school superintendents should be done by the federal government to ensure the individuals serve the interests of the students, to achieve employable skills. The majority of the ultra-Orthodox secondary schools in Rockland County are located in East Ramapo district. In the school district, the ultra-Orthodox schools have teamed up to hire a superintendent, making it difficult to raise awareness regarding the poor education students receive in the region.

Data from the study additionally provides recommendations for future researchers. Two areas emerged during the study which require further research. The areas include the social challenges students in ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools experience and how the challenges affect performances and the integration of ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school

graduates into higher education. In the study, a qualitative approach with a small sample size was used, making the generalizability of the final results difficult. The recommendation is for future researchers to carry out further studies on the same research topic but using a quantitative approach with a larger sample size to increase the generalizability of the research outcomes.

### **Implications for Leadership**

The findings from the study provided important information in understating the state of education in ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools. The U.S. government needs to develop and implement education policies aimed at providing egalitarian education policies across both public and private schools. Ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools are no different, and the students' needs for religious, cultural, and secular education should be reflected in the curriculum. Given the demanding nature of the job market and the necessity of a career for most individuals to support their families, the hope is ultra-Orthodox leadership will become more aware of the barriers identified in the study and actively promulgate policies to improve both the skill sets Haredi men bring to the job market and the employment rates within the community.

Aside from the implications for religious leadership, the findings from the study have implications for ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school leadership. As a result of being better informed of the specific barriers between students and the mainstream job market, ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school leadership may become more open to the idea of allowing adequate time to be spent on students in the quest to acquire employable skills and become more competitive in the job market. Both the community and school leadership can coordinate to devise programs, policies, and systems aimed at teaching students to become more aware of the importance of striving for a career and learning the associated skill sets.

As demonstrated throughout the study, ultra-Orthodox male students often forgo secular studies, which would have trained the students for the job market in favor of religious education aimed at preserving their faith and heritage. The findings from the study revealed ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools could find a balance between secular and religious education. The decision for ultra-Orthodox leadership to change revolves around the fact, while religion is important in preserving both religious faith and cultural heritage, the need to interact and coexist with the secular world is a necessity in life for many ultra-Orthodox community members.

### **Conclusion**

The qualitative descriptive case study identified the cultural and religious factors acting as barriers to education for Haredi males in the United States. Semi structured interviews were used to collect in-depth information regarding the research topic. The study revealed cultural and religious beliefs affect the quality of education individuals in ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools receive, negatively affecting the level of employable skills. The barriers male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates face in acquiring employment include lack of language proficiency, lack of core education, cultural restrictions, discrimination, and having large families. Developing government oversight policies in education can help improve the quality of education both in private and public sectors. These policies can ensure ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary schools balance between religious and secular education.

## References

- Albright, S., Winston, W., & Zappe, C. (2014). *Data analysis & decision making with Microsoft Excel* (2nd ed.). Mason, OH: South-Western/Cengage.
- Alpert, R. (2019). The new American Judaism: How Jews practice their religion today. By Jack Wertheimer [Book review]. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 87(2), 559–562. doi:10.1093/jaarel/lfz012
- Ariel, Y. (2016). Biblical narratives, messianic hopes and religious radicalism: Jewish fundamentalism in our time. *Interdisciplinary Journal for Religion and Transformation in Contemporary Society*, 2(2), 185–200. doi:10.14220/23642807-00202010
- Arlosoroff, M. (2016). *With little schooling, ultra-Orthodox men struggle to find jobs*. Retrieved from <http://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/business/.premium-1.708219>
- Bachner-Melman, R., & Zohar, A. H. (2019). Potential risk and protective factors for eating disorders in Haredi (ultra-Orthodox) Jewish women. *Journal of Religion and Health*, 58(6), 2161–2174. doi:10.1007/s10943-019-00854-2
- Bandura, A. (1989). Human agency in social cognitive theory. *American Psychologist*, 44(9), 1175–1184. doi:10.1037/0003-066x.44.9.1175
- Bandura, A. (1991). Social cognitive theory of self-regulation. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes*, 50(2), 248–287. doi:10.1016/0749-5978(91)90022-1
- Bandura, A. (2001). Social cognitive theory: An agentic perspective. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 52(1), 1–26. doi:10.1146/annurev.psych.52.1.1
- Bandura, A. (2002). Social cognitive theory in cultural context. *Applied Psychology*, 51(2), 269–290. doi:10.1111/1464-0597.00092

- Bandura, A. (2009). Social cognitive theory goes global. *The Psychologist*, 9(4), 13–19.  
Retrieved from <https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2009-08932-006>
- Bandura, A. (2012). On the functional properties of perceived self-efficacy revisited. *Journal of Management*, 38(1), 9–44. doi:10.1177/0149206311410606
- Barth, A., & Benoliel, P. (2019). School religious–cultural attributes and school principals’ leadership styles in Israel. *Religious Education*, 114(4), 470–485. doi:10.1080/00344087.2019.1581873
- Baum, N., Yedidya, T., Schwartz, C., & Aran, O. (2014). Women pursuing higher education in ultra-Orthodox society. *Journal of Social Work Education*, 50(1), 164–175. doi:10.1080/10437797.2014.856242
- Beer, H. (2018). Mind the gap! The schism between perceptions of the Yiddish language and Yiddish cultural realities. In L. Kahn (Ed.), *Jewish languages in historical perspective* (pp. 159–169). doi:10.1163/9789004376588\_009
- Bell, D. N., & Blanchflower, D. G. (2018). *Underemployment in the US and Europe* (No. w24927). doi:10.3386/w24927
- BenDavid, I., & Iram, Y. (2014). Access to higher education: The Israeli case. *International Higher Education*, 13(77), 27–28. doi:10.6017/ihe.2014.77.5686
- Ben-David Kolikant, Y., & Genut, S. (2017). The effect of prior education on students’ competency in digital logic: The case of ultraorthodox Jewish students. *Computer Science Education*, 27(3–4), 149–174. doi:10.1080/08993408.2017.1414364
- Bieler, J. (1986). Integration of Judaic and general studies in the modern Orthodox day school. *Jewish Education*, 54(4), 15–26. doi:10.1080/0021642860540403

- Bittinger, S. B. (2017). *Perceptions of bachelor-degree graduates regarding general education program quality* (Doctoral dissertation, Frostburg State University).
- Blass, N., & Shavit, Y. (2016). Equality and multiculturalism in public education: Thoughts about the present, proposals for the future. *State of the Nation Report: Society, Economy and Policy in Israel*, 7(17), 243–246. Retrieved from [http://taubcenter.org.il/wp-content/files\\_mf/educationopedeng.pdf](http://taubcenter.org.il/wp-content/files_mf/educationopedeng.pdf)
- Blumen, O., & Freedland, E. (2019). “The elephant in the room is the role model”: Managing the paradox of pregnancy in the ultra-Orthodox Jewish classroom. In H. Mahmoudi & S. Mintz (Eds.), *Children and globalization: Multidisciplinary perspectives* (pp. 100–122). doi:10.4324/9780429261633-6
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101. doi:10.1191/1478088706qp063oa
- Braun-Lewensohn, O., & Kalagy, T. (2019). Between the inside and the outside world: Coping of ultra-Orthodox individuals with their work environment after academic studies. *Community Mental Health Journal*, 55(5), 894–905. doi:10.1007/s10597-019-00392-x
- Brown, E. (2018). Education for an ex-role: Perceptions of schooling from the newly un-orthodox. *Religious Education*, 113(5), 439–449. doi:10.1080/00344087.2018.1436370
- Brown, I. (2019). From ideology to halakhah: Ultra-Orthodox opposition to modern Hebrew. *Studies in Judaism, Humanities, and the Social Sciences*, 1(2), 13–17. Retrieved from <http://journals.academicstudiespress.com/index.php/SJHSS/article/view/103>
- Bussey, K., & Bandura, A. (1999). Social cognitive theory of gender development and differentiation. *Psychological Review*, 106(4), 676–713. doi:10.1037/0033-295x.106.4.676

- Chiswick, B. R., & Miller, P. W. (2018). Do native-born bilinguals in the US earn more? *Review of Economics of the Household*, 16(3), 563–583. doi:10.1007/s11150-017-9398-5
- Cochran, J. A. (2017). Israel: Divided by religion and education. *Digest of Middle East Studies*, 26(1), 32–55. doi:10.1111/dome.12106
- Cohen, Y. (2017). The media challenge to Haredi rabbinic authority in Israel. *ESSACHESS—Journal for Communication Studies*, 10(2), 113–128. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/322295063\\_The\\_media\\_challenge\\_to\\_Haredi\\_rabbinic\\_authority\\_in\\_Israel](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/322295063_The_media_challenge_to_Haredi_rabbinic_authority_in_Israel)
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2017). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Dehan, N. (2013). Case study: The first Israeli BSW program for Haredi women students. *Journal of Social Work Education*, 49(4), 716–732. doi:10.1080/10437797.2013.812904
- Deutsch, Z. (2018). The effect of the “Tal Law” on the supply of labor among ultra-Orthodox men. *Israel Economic Review*, 15(1), 65–69. Retrieved from <https://ideas.repec.org/a/boi/isrerv/v15y2018i1p35-71.html>
- Elliot, G. (2019). *A social cognitive investigation into the self-efficacy beliefs of religious education teachers in Australian Catholic high schools*. Retrieved from <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses1/783/>
- Engelsman, S. P., Huss, E., & Cwikel, J. (2018). How ultra-Orthodox (Haredi) Israeli women cope with normative and difficult pregnancy and childbirth experiences. *Nashim: A Journal of Jewish Women’s Studies & Gender Issues*, (33), 136–157. doi:10.2979/nashim.33.1.07



- Feldman, A. (2019). Education and employment among ultra-Orthodox women in Israel: Modernity and conservatism—The case of the Shas party. *Contemporary Jewry*, 32(3), 334–362. doi:10.1007/s12397-019-09304-3
- Finkelman, Y. (2011). Ultra-Orthodox/Haredi education. In H. Miller, L. Grant, & A. Pomson (Eds.), *International handbooks of religion and education* (pp. 1063–1080). doi:10.1007/978-94-007-0354-4\_58
- Finkelman. (2014). The ambivalent Haredi Jew. *Israel Studies*, 19(2), 264–293. doi:10.2979/israelstudies.19.2.264
- Freund, A. (2019). A culturally-based socialization to social work: Comparison of faith-based and secular students. *Social Work Education*, 9(7), 1–16. doi:10.1080/02615479.2019.1664453
- Freund, A., Zriker, A., & Shor, E. (2019). Ideological–spiritual fulfillment of ultra-Orthodox Jewish employment women. *Academy of Management Proceedings*, 2019(1), 13674–13679. doi:10.5465/ambpp.2019.13674abstract
- Friedman, S., Paradis, C. M., & Cukor, D. (2019). Cognitive behavior therapy with Orthodox Jews. In G. Y. Iwamasa & P. A. Hays (Eds.), *Culturally responsive cognitive behavior therapy: Practice and supervision* (pp. 209–228). doi:10.1037/0000119-009
- Fusch, P. I., Fusch, G. E., & Ness, L. R. (2018). Denzin’s paradigm shift: Revisiting triangulation in qualitative research. *Journal of Social Change*, 10(1), 19–32. doi:10.5590/JOSC>2018.10.1.02
- Fusch, P. I., & Ness, L. R. (2015). Are we there yet? Data saturation in qualitative research. *The Qualitative Report*, 20(9), 1408–1416. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282955844\\_Are\\_We\\_There\\_Yet\\_Data\\_Saturation\\_in\\_Qualitative\\_Research](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282955844_Are_We_There_Yet_Data_Saturation_in_Qualitative_Research)

- Gabbay, E., McCarthy, M. W., & Fins, J. J. (2017). The care of the ultra-Orthodox Jewish patient. *Journal of Religion and Health*, 56(2), 545–560. doi:10.1007/s10943-017-0356-6
- Gal, R., Morgenstern, Y., & Elimelech, Y. (2018). Excellence in mathematics in the ultra-Orthodox community: Fantasy or reality? *K–12 Mathematics Education in Israel: Issues and Innovations*, 13, 59–63. doi:10.1142/9789813231191\_0006
- Ganz, Z. (2019). Conflicts and challenges faced by ultra-Orthodox Jewish social work students: Broaching and a social constructivist approach to supervision as a forum for resolution. *The Clinical Supervisor*, 39(1), 1–21. doi:10.1080/07325223.2019.1652948
- Genut, S., & Ben-David Kolikant, Y. (2017). Undergraduate Haredi students studying computer science: Is their prior education merely a barrier? *Interdisciplinary Journal of e-Skills and Lifelong Learning*, 13, 197–214. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Sara\\_Genut/publication/322487314\\_Undergraduate\\_Haredi\\_Students\\_Studying\\_Computer\\_Science\\_Is\\_Their\\_Prior\\_Education\\_Merely\\_a\\_Barrier/links/5a5b3e7fa6fdcc3bfb606ad4/Undergraduate-Haredi-Students-Studying-Computer-Science-Is-Their-Prior-Education-Merely-a-Barrier.pdf](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Sara_Genut/publication/322487314_Undergraduate_Haredi_Students_Studying_Computer_Science_Is_Their_Prior_Education_Merely_a_Barrier/links/5a5b3e7fa6fdcc3bfb606ad4/Undergraduate-Haredi-Students-Studying-Computer-Science-Is-Their-Prior-Education-Merely-a-Barrier.pdf)
- Glaubman, R., & Lifshitz, H. (2001). Ultra-Orthodox Jewish teachers' self-efficacy and willingness for inclusion of pupils with special needs. *European Journal of Special Needs Education*, 16(3), 207–223. doi:10.1080/08856250110074373
- Greenberg, Z. (2018, July 23). A law tailored for Orthodox Jewish schools is unconstitutional, lawsuit says. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/07/23/nyregion/yeshivas-lawsuit-secular-education.html>
- Hakak, Y. (2016). *Haredi masculinities between the yeshiva, the army, work and politics*. Retrieved from <https://brill.com/view/title/33336>

- Haller, R., Golden, D., & Tavecchio, L. (2018). Negotiating tradition and contemporary education: An enrichment center for Jewish ultra-Orthodox children in Israel. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, 49(3), 230–245. doi:10.1111/aeq.12250
- Hamo, G., & Idisis, Y. (2017). Pedophiles in the ultra-Orthodox Haredi sector in Israel: Thought processes regarding their actions. *Journal of Child Sexual Abuse*, 26(4), 407–427. doi:10.1080/10538712.2017.1285841
- Haron, Y., & Azuri, P. (2016). Integrating ultra-Orthodox Jewish men in academic nursing training. *Journal of Transcultural Nursing*, 27(6), 627–632. doi:10.1177/1043659615604026
- Hary, B., & Benor, S. B. (2018). *Languages in Jewish communities, past and present*. doi:10.1515/9781501504631-017
- Heinemann, J., Atallah, S., & Rosenbaum, T. (2016). The impact of culture and ethnicity on sexuality and sexual function. *Current Sexual Health Reports*, 8(3), 144–150. doi:10.1007/s11930-016-0088-8
- Héliot, Y., Gleibs, I. H., Coyle, A., Rousseau, D. M., & Rojon, C. (2019). Religious identity in the workplace: A systematic review, research agenda, and practical implications. *Human Resource Management*, 59(2), 153–173. doi:10.1002/hrm.21983
- Helmreich, W. B. (2000). *The world of the yeshiva: An intimate portrait of Orthodox Jewry*. New York, NY: KTAV.
- Holbrook, C., Izuma, K., Deblieck, C., Fessler, D. M., & Iacoboni, M. (2016). Neuromodulation of group prejudice and religious belief. *Social Cognitive and Affective Neuroscience*, 11(3), 387–394. doi:10.1093/scan/nsv107

- Iluz, S., Katz, Y. J., & Stern, H. (2018). Learning standards in a non-standard system: Mapping student knowledge and comprehension in ultra-Orthodox Talmud Torah schools. *Journal of Religious Education*, 66(3), 165–181. doi:10.1007/s40839-018-0071-y
- Katzir, S., & Perry-Hazan, L. (2019). Legitimizing public schooling and innovative education policies in strict religious communities: The story of the new Haredi public education stream in Israel. *Journal of Education Policy*, 34(2), 215–241. doi:10.1080/02680939.2018.1438671
- Kaufman, K. (2019). Searching for a suitable education: A comparative law analysis of state regulation of independent faith-based schools. *Przegląd Konstytucyjny*, 11(2), 26–51. Retrieved from <http://www.przegląd.konstytucyjny.law.uj.edu.pl/article/view/231/121>
- Kay, A., & Levine, L. (2019). Offline: The possible effects of Internet-related behavior on work values, expectations, & behavior among ultra-Orthodox millennials. *Journal of Social Psychology*, 159(2), 210–224. doi:10.1080/00224545.2019.1570907
- Keren-Kratz, M. (2016). Westernization and Israelization within Israel's extreme Orthodox Haredi society. *Israel Studies Review*, 31(2), 101–129. doi:10.3167/isr.2016.310207
- Kilpeläinen, A., & Nielsen, M. (2018). Teaching rituals: New church activities and religious education. *International Journal of Practical Theology*, 22(1), 23–39. doi:10.1515/ijpt-2016-0035
- Kingsbury, I. (2018). Haredi education in Israel: Fiscal solutions and practical challenges. *British Journal of Religious Education*, 42(2), 193–201. doi:10.1080/01416200.2018.1556603
- Kohn, E. (2017). The student voice in designing a Jewish studies high school curriculum: A case study. *Journal of Curriculum and Teaching*, 6(2), 18–23. doi:10.5430/jct.v6n2p18

- Krakowski, M. (2017). Developing and transmitting religious identity: Curriculum and pedagogy in modern Orthodox Jewish schools. *Contemporary Jewry*, 37(3), 433–456. doi:10.1007/s12397-017-9205-x
- Lavee, D., Kahn, Y., & Fisher, Y. (2018). Benefits of social impact bonds in reducing unemployment levels among ultra-Orthodox Jews in Israel. *International Journal of Public Policy*, 14(3/4), 235–257. doi:10.1504/ijpp.2018.091956
- Leech, N. L., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2011). Beyond constant comparison qualitative data analysis: Using NVivo. *School Psychology Quarterly*, 26(1), 70–84. doi:10.1037/a0022711
- Levin, S. (2018). Test of faith: Haredi communities and the right to education. *International Journal of Law, Policy and the Family*. doi:10.1093/lawfam/eby015
- Levy, D. (2019). *Bridging between Jewish ultra-Orthodox and the start-up nation: A case study*. doi:10.1007/978-3-030-21902-4\_37
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Lipshits, H. (2015). Budgeting for ultra-Orthodox education—The failure of ultra-Orthodox politics, 1996–2006. *Israel Studies*, 20(2), 135–162. doi:10.2979/israelstudies.20.2.135
- Luce, C. E. (2018). Yiddish writers in Los Angeles and the Jewish fantasy past. *American Jewish History*, 102(4), 481–509. doi:10.1353/ajh.2018.0048
- Malach, G., Cohen, D., & Zicherman, H. (2016). *A master plan for ultra-Orthodox employment in Israel* (Policy Paper 11E). Jerusalem, Israel: The Israel Democracy Institute.
- Matthews, K., & Frost, M. (2015). Religion vs. education: City probes Orthodox schools, 38 in Brooklyn. *The Brooklyn Eagle*. Retrieved from <http://www.brooklyneagle.com>

- May-Yazdi, O., & BenDavid-Hader, I. (2018). The relationships between income, academic education, and financial literacy: The case of the ultra-Orthodox in Israel. *Education and Society, 36*(2), 49–76. doi:10.7459/es/36.2.05
- Mendes, P. (2018). The politics of nonassimilation: The American Jewish left in the twentieth century by David Verbeeten [Book review]. *American Jewish History, 102*(2), 317–319. doi:10.1353/ajh.2018.0029
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley.
- Metters, R. (2019). The effect of employee and customer religious beliefs on business operating decisions. *Religions, 10*(8), 479–481. doi:10.3390/rel10080479
- Moran, M. (2019). General education in the legal studies curriculum. *The Legal Educator, 34*(1), 20–30. Retrieved from [https://academicworks.cuny.edu/ny\\_pubs/466/](https://academicworks.cuny.edu/ny_pubs/466/)
- Morse, J. M. (1994). Designing funded qualitative research. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (2nd ed., pp. 220–235). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Moskovich, Y., & Liberman, I. (2018). Group identity and social closeness. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy, 38*(3/4), 259–279. doi:10.1108/ijssp-06-2017-0085
- Nabi, R. L., & Prestin, A. (2017). *Social learning theory and social cognitive theory*. doi:10.1002/9781118783764.wbieme0073
- Nadan, Y., Gemara, N., Keesing, R., Bamberger, E., Roer-Strier, D., & Korbin, J. (2019). “Spiritual risk”: A parental perception of risk for children in the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community. *British Journal of Social Work, 49*(5), 1198–1215. doi:10.1093/bjsw/bcy092

- Neumann, W. L. (2007). *Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches* (6th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson.
- Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). Purposeful sampling for qualitative data collection and analysis in mixed method implementation research. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research*, 42(5), 533–544. doi:10.1007/s10488-013-0528-y
- Pearson, M. (2018). *In-depth qualitative interviewing: Lessons learned from interviewing vulnerable and hard-to-access groups as part of a study into the inquest process*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Percy, W. H., Kostere, K., & Kostere, S. (2015). Generic qualitative research in psychology. *The Qualitative Report*, 20(2), 76–85. Retrieved from <https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol20/iss2/7/>
- Perelman, Y., Yaish, M., & Bental, B. (2019). The price of religiosity: Enticing young Haredi men into secular academic studies. *Rationality and Society*, 31(2), 129–151. doi:10.1177/1043463119831271
- Perry-Hazan, L., & Perelstain, O. (2018). Mobilizing ethnic equality in admissions to schools: Litigation, politics, and educational change. *Journal of Educational Change*, 19(1), 51–75. doi:10.1007/s10833-017-9308-x
- Pew Research Center. (2013). *A portrait of Jewish Americans*. Retrieved from <https://www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey/>
- Prawer Kadar, N. (Ed.) (2017). *Raising secular Jews: Yiddish schools and their periodicals for American children, 1917–1950*. Lebanon, NH: Brandeis University Press.

- Rasit, R. M., Hamjah, S. H., & Mansor, S. F. (2016). Provision of shariah-compliant hotel services towards Muslim tourism in Malaysia. *International Conference on Business, Economics, Social Science & Humanities*, 16(157), 14–20. Retrieved from <http://academicfora.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Full-Paper-Proceeding-SUS-256-108.pdf>
- Regev, D. (2017). Supervisors' perceptions of art therapy in the Israeli education system. *International Journal of Art Therapy*, 22(3), 96–105. doi:10.1080/17454832.2016.1245766
- Ritchie, J., & Lewis, J. (2003). *Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers*. London, England: Sage.
- Rosenberg, D. (2018, December 7). *Haredi poverty: The same threat in both New York and Israel*. Retrieved from <https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/.premium-haredi-poverty-the-same-threat-in-both-new-york-and-israel-1.6724049>
- Russo-Netzer, P., & Bergman, Y. S. (2019). Prioritizing patterns and life satisfaction among ultra-Orthodox Jews: The moderating role of the sense of community. *Journal of Psychology*, 154(3), 233–248. doi:10.1080/00223980.2019.1704392
- Schapiro-Halberstam, S., & Josephs, L. (2018). Unkosher sex: Vulnerable narcissism and ultra-Orthodox Jewish men. *Journal of Sex & Marital Therapy*, 44(7), 679–686. doi:10.1080/0092623X.2018.1452087
- Schunk, D. H., & DiBenedetto, M. K. (2016). Social cognitive theory, self-efficacy, and students with disabilities. In A. J. Martin, R. A. Sperling, & K. J. Newton (Eds.), *Handbook of educational psychology and students with special needs* (pp. 243–261). doi:10.4324/9781315100654-13



- Schunk, D. H., & DiBenedetto, M. K. (2020). Motivation and social cognitive theory. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 60, 101832–101839. doi:10.1016/j.cedpsych.2019.101832
- Seginer, R., & Mahajna, S. (2018). Future orientation in cultural transition: Acculturation strategies of youth from three minority groups in Israel. *New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development*, 2018(160), 31–43. doi:10.1002/cad.20238
- Shiffer, V. (1999). The Haredi educational system: Allocation of public funds. *Contemporary Jewry*, 20(1), 138–166. doi:10.1007/bf02967963
- Spilka, B. (2019). *The psychology of religion*. doi:10.4324/9780429495915
- Spradley, J. P. (2016). *Participant observation*. Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.
- Tang, T. L. (2016). Theory of monetary intelligence: Money attitudes—Religious values, making money, making ethical decisions, and making the grade. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 133(3), 583–603. doi:10.1007/s10551-014-2411-5
- Taras, V., Steel, P., & Kirkman, B. L. (2016). Research: The biggest cultural gaps are within countries, not between them. *Management International Review*, 56(4), 455–487.  
Retrieved from <https://hbr.org/2016/05/research-the-biggest-culture-gaps-are-within-countries-not-between-them>
- Terry, G., Hayfield, N., Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. In W. S. Rogers & C. Willig (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research in psychology* (pp. 17–37). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Toye, F., Williamson, E., Williams, M. A., Fairbank, J., & Lamb, S. E. (2016). What value can qualitative research add to quantitative research design? An example from an adolescent

- idiopathic scoliosis trial feasibility study. *Qualitative Health Research*, 26(13), 1838–1850. doi:10.1177/1049732316662446
- U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (2019). *Informed Consent*. Retrieved from <https://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/regulations-and-policy/guidance/informed-consent/index.html>
- Vivod, M. (2019). Haredi masculinities between the yeshiva, the army, work and politics: The sage, the warrior and the entrepreneur. *Culture and Religion*, 18(4), 474–475. doi:10.1080/14755610.2017.1382985
- Wagner, D. (2017). Concealed parental involvement: Haredi fatherhood. In M. Gross, S. Nizard, & Y. Scioldo-Zurcher (Eds.), *Gender, families and transmission in the contemporary Jewish context* (pp. 25–34). Retrieved from [https://www.academia.edu/32136696/CONCEALED\\_PARENTAL\\_INVOLVEMENT\\_HAREDI\\_FATHERHOOD](https://www.academia.edu/32136696/CONCEALED_PARENTAL_INVOLVEMENT_HAREDI_FATHERHOOD)
- Waksman, A. (2019, February 7). *Employment rate of Haredi Men stagnates despite advances in job market*. Retrieved from <https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/employment-rate-of-haredi-men-stagnates-despite-advances-in-job-market-1.6914601>
- Waxman, C. I. (2017). Insights and questions from the Pew report on America's Orthodox Jews. *American Jewish Year Book 2016*, 69–72. doi:10.1007/978-3-319-46122-9\_11
- Weisberg. (2018). *Aligning mission and practice: Social justice curriculum for Jewish secondary day school students*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, Los Angeles.
- Wigôder, R. Z. W. G., & Werblowsky, R. Z. (1997). *The Oxford dictionary of the Jewish religion*. Oxford, England: Oxford University Press.
- Wood, R., & Bandura, A. (1989). Social cognitive theory of organizational management. *Academy of Management Review*, 14(3), 361–384. doi:10.5465/amr.1989.4279067

Yaffe, N., McDonald, M., Halperin, E., & Saguy, T. (2018). God, sex, and money among the ultra-Orthodox in Israel: An integrated sociocultural and evolutionary perspective.

*Evolution and Human Behavior*, 39(6), 622–631. doi:10.1016/j.evolhumbehav.2018.06

.007

## Appendix A: Informed Consent

**Prospective Research Participant:** Read this consent form carefully and ask as many questions as you like before you decide whether you want to participate in this research study. You are free to ask questions at any time before, during, or after your participation in this research.

### Project Information

**Project Title:** Ultra-Orthodox Jews as Active Participants in the Workforce: A Qualitative Study of the Effects of Education

**Researcher:** Scott Klein

**Organization:** American College of Education

**Email:** [scottiraklein@gmail.com](mailto:scottiraklein@gmail.com) **Telephone:** 773-547-3822

**Researcher's Faculty Member:** Dr. Marsha Moore

**Organization and Position:** American College of Education Administrative Faculty and MAT/T2T Program Coordinator, Department of Teaching and Learning

**Email:** [marsha.moore@ace.edu](mailto:marsha.moore@ace.edu)

### Introduction

I am Scott Klein, and I am a doctoral candidate student at American College of Education. I am doing research under the guidance and supervision of my Chair, Dr. \_\_\_\_\_. I will give you some information about the project and invite you to be part of this research. Before you decide, you can talk to anyone you feel comfortable with about the research. This consent form may contain words you do not understand. Please ask me to stop as we go through the information, and I will explain. If you have questions later, you can ask them then.

### Purpose of the Research

You are being asked to participate in a research study which will assist with understanding the effects of education on ultra-Orthodox Jewish males as active participants in the workforce. This qualitative case study is intended to identify barriers that hinder male ultra-Orthodox Jewish

secondary school graduates in acquiring employment in the United States. The aim is also to identify potential affordances that may help male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary school graduates overcome these barriers.

### **Research Design and Procedures**

The study will use a qualitative methodology with interviews and an online questionnaire. Informed consent forms and interview guides will be disseminated to specific participants within the ultra-Orthodox Jewish male community in New York. The study will be comprised of 12 participants, randomly selected, who will participate in semi-structured interviews and the completion of a two-question questionnaire to be completed online after the interview and at the participants' convenience. The study will involve interviews to be conducted at the site most convenient for participants; the questionnaires can be completed at home.

### **Participant selection**

You are being invited to take part in this research because of your experience as an ultra-Orthodox Jewish male seeking employment or currently employed in the workforce who can contribute much to the perceptions and experiences of this population, which meets the criteria for this study. Participant selection criteria:

- (a) male Haredi, ultra-Orthodox Jews,
- (b) at least 25 and no more than 55 years of age,

(c) educated exclusively in the United States at a Yeshiva, whether at home or in another educational institution, (d) out of school for at least five years, during which they have sought employment in the United States,

(e) fluent in written and spoken English, and

(f) willing to participate in a face-to-face, audio-recorded interview.

### **Voluntary Participation**

Your participation in this research is entirely voluntary. It is your choice whether to participate. If you choose not to participate, there will be no punitive repercussions and you do not have to participate. If you select to participate in this study, you may change your mind later and stop participating even if you agreed earlier.

### **Procedures**

We are inviting you to participate in this research study. If you agree, you will be asked to contact the researcher, sign the informed consent form, and choose a site and time for an interview. The type of questions asked will range from a demographical perspective to direct inquiries about the topic of employment as an Haredi educated ultra-Orthodox Jewish male seeking or finding employment in the US.

### **Duration**

The interview portion of the research study will require approximately 1 ½ hours to complete (5 minutes for the phone call and approximately 45 to 60 minutes for the interview). If you are chosen to be interviewed, the time allotted for in-person interviews will be at a location and time convenient for the participant.

**Risks**

The researcher will ask you to share personal and confidential information, and you may feel uncomfortable talking about some of the topics. You do not have to answer any question or take part in the discussion if you don't wish to do so. You do not have to give any reason for not responding to any question.

**Benefits**

There are no benefits associated with participation in the study, other than contributing to insights that may potentially help ultra-Orthodox Jewish males be better prepared to enter the job market.

**Confidentiality**

I will not share information about you or anything you say to anyone outside of the research. During the defense of the doctoral dissertation, data collected will be presented to the dissertation committee. The data collected will be kept on a flash drive in a locked file cabinet. Any personal information about you will be coded and will not have a direct correlation which directly identifies you as the participant. Only I will know what your number is, and I will secure your information.

**Sharing the Results**

At the end of the research study, the results will be available for each participant. It is anticipated to publish the results so other interested people may learn from the research.

**Right to Refuse or Withdraw**

Participation is voluntary. At any time, you wish to end your participation in the research study, you may do so without repercussions.

**Questions About the Study**

If you have any questions, you can ask them now or later. If you wish to ask questions later, you may contact me by phone, text, or email: [scottiraklein@gmail.com](mailto:scottiraklein@gmail.com). This research plan has been reviewed and approved by the Institutional Review Board of American College of Education. This is a committee whose role is to make sure research participants are protected from harm. If you wish to ask questions of this group, email [IRB@ace.edu](mailto:IRB@ace.edu).

**Certificate of Consent**

I have read the information about this study, or it has been read to me. I acknowledge why I have been asked to be a participant in the research study. I have been provided the opportunity to ask questions about the study, and any questions have been answered to my satisfaction. I certify I am at least 18 years of age. I consent voluntarily to be a participant in this study.

Print or Type Name of Participant: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature of Participant: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_



I confirm that the participant was given an opportunity to ask questions about the study, and all the questions asked by the participant have been answered to the best of my ability. I confirm that the individual has not been coerced into giving consent, and the consent has been given freely and voluntarily. A copy of this Consent Form has been provided to the participant.

Print or type name of lead researcher: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature of lead researcher: \_\_\_\_\_

I have accurately read or witnessed the accurate reading of the assent form to the potential participant, and the individual has had the opportunity to ask questions. I confirm the individual has freely given assent.

Print or type name of lead researcher: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature of lead researcher: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature of faculty member: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**PLEASE KEEP THIS INFORMED CONSENT FORM FOR YOUR RECORDS.**

## Appendix B: Recruitment Letter

Dear Friend,

I am writing to ask your help in participating in a research study I'm conducting Ultra-Orthodox Jews in the Workforce in regard to how social and cultural factors act as barriers to employment. Your participation is confidential and voluntary, and you are free to answer any questions you'd like, to withdraw your consent and/or to discontinue participation at any time without penalty. The general purpose of the study is to examine the ways in which Asian immigrant family culture shapes children's long-term views on family, ethnicity and culture. It is estimated that there will be at least 12 participants interviewed.

If you volunteer to participate in this study, I will first ask for some brief background information vis-a-vis e-mail or phone in order to prepare for our interviews. With your consent, I would then ask you to provide about 30-45 minutes of your free time for an audio-taped, face-to-face interview. The interview will consist of open-ended questions about childhood/family experiences, past/current relationships and activities, school/workplace experiences, and views on identity, family and culture. The interview will be scheduled at a time and place that is most convenient for you. If you are available, I may also get in touch with you to cover any follow-up questions, although you are free to decline at any stage of the research. Other than potential discomfort in answering these questions, risks will be minimal, given these interviews are strictly voluntary and confidential and interview questions are open-ended. For further information contact:

Researcher: Scott Klein

Organization: American College of Education

Email: [scottiraklein@gmail.com](mailto:scottiraklein@gmail.com) Telephone: 773-547-3822

### Appendix C: Semistructured Interview Questions

1. To what degree were religion and culture a factor in your secondary school education?
2. What essential skills did you learn in secondary school that influenced the attainment of employable skill sets?
3. What barriers existed in male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary education in terms of allowing one to be competitive with mainstream graduates seeking similar positions?
4. What strengths existed in male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary education in terms of preparing one for the job market?
5. What skills would you say are the most lacking for ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary graduates?
6. What practices in Haredi education can improve practical skill sets needed for the job market?
7. How can the cultural and religious values of the ultra-Orthodox Jews coexist with the values of mainstream education?
8. What skills sets are the most critical for an ultra-Orthodox Jewish male to have when entering the job market?

## Appendix D: Field Test of Instrument

----- Forwarded message -----  
 From: **Scott Klein**  
 Date: Fri, Aug 28, 2020 at 12:44 PM  
 Subject: Your expertise

Dear,

I am planning to conduct research in the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community regarding barriers and challenges currently presented for ultra-Orthodox Jewish men entering the workforce. I would like you to review my inclusion criteria as well as the interview questions below and provide me feedback on any suggestions or wording changes. You are being contacted due to your familiarity of the ultra-Orthodox Jewish culture and the general population focus presented for my research.

Participant selection criteria:

- (a) male Haredi, ultra-Orthodox Jews,
- (b) at least 25 and no more than 55 years of age,
- (c) educated exclusively in the United States at a Yeshiva, whether at home or in another education institution, (d) out of school for at least five years, during which they have sought employment in the United States,
- (e) fluent in written and spoken English, and
- (f) willing to participate in a face-to-face, audio-recorded interview.

Here are my interview questions:

1. To what degree were religion and cultures a factor in your secondary school education?
2. What essential skills did you learn in secondary school that influenced the attainment of employable skill sets?
3. What barriers existed in male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary education in terms of allowing one to be competitive with mainstream graduates seeking similar positions?
4. What strengths existed in male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary education in terms of preparing one for the job market?
5. What skills would you say are the most lacking for ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary graduates?
6. What practices in Haredi education can improve practical skill sets needed for the job market?
7. How can the cultural and religious values of the ultra-Orthodox Jews coexist with the values of mainstream education?
8. What skill sets are the most critical for an ultra-Orthodox Jewish male to have when entering the job market?

----- Forwarded message -----  
 From: **Scott Klein**  
 Date: Fri, Aug 28, 2020 at 12:44 PM  
 Subject: Hoping for a moment of your time

Dear,

I am planning to conduct research in the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community regarding barriers and challenges currently presented for ultra-Orthodox Jewish men entering the workforce. I would like you to review my inclusion criteria as well as the interview questions below and provide me feedback on any suggestions or wording changes. You are being contacted due to your familiarity of the ultra-Orthodox Jewish culture and the general population of focus presented for my research.

Participant selection criteria:

- (a) male Haredi, ultra-Orthodox Jews,
- (b) at least 25 and no more than 55 years of age,
- (c) educated exclusively in the United States at a Yeshiva, whether at home or in another education institution, (d) out of school for at least five years, during which they have sought employment in the United States,
- (e) fluent in written and spoken English, and
- (f) willing to participate in a face-to-face, audio-recorded interview.

Here are my interview questions:

1. To what degree were religion and cultures a factor in your secondary school education?
2. What essential skills did you learn in secondary school that influenced the attainment of employable skill sets?
3. What barriers existed in male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary education in terms of allowing one to be competitive with

---

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Scott Klein**  
Date: Fri, Aug 28, 2020 at 12:44 PM  
Subject: Can you help?

Dear ...

I am planning to conduct research in the ultra-Orthodox Jewish community regarding barriers and challenges currently presented for ultra-Orthodox Jewish men entering the workforce. I would like you to review my inclusion criteria as well as the interview questions below and provide me feedback on any suggestions or wording changes. You are being contacted due to your familiarity of the ultra-Orthodox Jewish culture and the general population of focus presented for my research.

Participant selection criteria:

- (a) male Haredi, ultra-Orthodox Jews,
- (b) at least 25 and no more than 55 years of age,
- (c) educated exclusively in the United States at a Yeshiva, whether at home or in another education institution, (d) out of school for at least five years, during which they have sought employment in the United States,
- (e) fluent in written and spoken English, and
- (f) willing to participate in a face-to-face, audio-recorded interview.

Here are my interview questions:

1. To what degree were religion and cultures a factor in your secondary school education?
2. What essential skills did you learn in secondary school that influenced the attainment of employable skill sets?
3. What barriers existed in male ultra-Orthodox Jewish secondary education in terms of allowing one to be competitive with